REOPENING WITH RESILIENCE:
Lessons from remote learning during COVID-19 in Latin America and the Caribbean
The COVID-19 crisis and resulting school closures began while countries in Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) were already experiencing a learning crisis. The most recent international learning assessments, such as Third Regional Comparative and Explicative Study (TERCE) (UNESCO–LLECE, 2015) and Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) (PISA, 2021), show low learning levels in the region, with wide disparities based on gender and wealth, and between urban and rural areas (Laboratorio Latinoamericano de Evaluación de la Calidad de la Educación (LLECE), 2020; Álvarez-Marinelli et al., 2020; García-Jaramillo, 2020). These international assessments do not consider the 12 million children who were already out-of-school before the COVID-19 crisis (UNESCO UIS, 2019). Considering both in- and out-of-school children, the learning poverty rate measures the share of children who are unable to read a simple text by the age of 10. Learning poverty stood at 51 per cent in the region prior to COVID-19 school closures (World Bank, 2021a). At the start of the crisis in March 2020, all countries except for Nicaragua fully closed schools (ECLAC and UNESCO, 2020).

As of August 2021, countries in the region had experienced an average of 347 days of full or partial education system closures (see Figure 1).

The prolonged nature of the school closures, in a region already experiencing low learning levels, risks deepening the learning crisis and widening existing learning inequalities. Recent studies estimate that 3 million children will not return to school, with this number increasing the longer schools are closed (Seusan and Maradiegue, 2020). The learning poverty rate is expected to increase from 51 per cent to 62.5 per cent due to school closures (World Bank, 2021a). The recent evidence is clear that there is no replacement for in-person learning and that schools should reopen as soon as possible (UNICEF, 2021a). However, the widespread school closures during the COVID-19 crisis have also shown the great need for reliable remote learning systems if schools are forced to close.

1 Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA, 2021) measures 15-year-olds’ ability to use their reading, mathematics and science knowledge and skills to meet real-life challenges.
FIGURE 1. Harmonized Learning Outcomes by number of fully or partially closed school days from February 2020 to August 2021

Note: Data on learning outcomes pre-COVID come from the HLO database of 164 countries and learning outcomes from 2000 to 2017 (Angrist et al., 2021). Data on the duration of education systems being fully and partially closed come from UNESCO Global monitoring of school closures due to COVID-19. The size of the circle represents the school-age population of a country with data from UNESCO Institute for Statistics.
While schools were closed, countries across LAC implemented remote learning strategies using a combination of paper-based take-home packages, broadcast media (TV and radio) and online digital solutions. Throughout this crisis, more than 75 per cent of LAC countries have implemented online platforms from pre-primary through upper-secondary education (UNESCO, UNICEF, World Bank and OECD, 2021).

Yet, countries faced challenges to properly respond to school closures. For any type of technology-enabled remote learning, electricity for students and teachers is a necessity. However, some countries in the region – including Haiti, Nicaragua, Honduras, Guatemala, Panama, Bolivia (Plurinational State of) and Peru – have not achieved full access to electricity and there are large inequities in access between urban and rural areas (see Figure 3). In Haiti, the situation is dire with less than half of the population (45.4 per cent) having access to electricity, ranging from just 1 per cent of the rural population to 80 per cent of the population in urban areas. In the regions and areas with electricity, a wide digital divide already existed before COVID-19 and has been an obstacle for accessing remote learning. Figures from TERCE and PISA showed wide disparities across wealth quintiles in household access to a computer and an internet connection (García-Jaramillo, 2020) (see Figure 4). Data collected during the pandemic highlighted the challenges of implementing digital remote learning modalities: 37 per cent of households in Ecuador (UNICEF, 2020a), 30 per cent of households in Argentina (UNICEF, 2021a) and close to 75 per cent of households with children enrolled in public education in Bolivia (UNDP Bolivia Office, 2020) did not have access to the internet at home. Low levels of connectivity in Bolivia...
led the government to set regulations and establish programmes to incorporate remote learning into the education system (see Box 1).

The quality of internet connectivity was also a constraint for students and teachers. In a recent survey of adolescents using the internet in Bolivia (Plurinational State of), 30 per cent of students reported they could only access internet on their phones and a majority of them had challenges recharging their data packages (UNICEF, 2021c). As for teachers, 54 per cent of surveyed teachers

**BOX 1. BOLIVIA (PLURINATIONAL STATE OF): LESSONS TO BUILD BACK BETTER**

In Bolivia (Plurinational State of), responding to the need to ensure access to remote learning for all children, the government and its development partners have come together to improve the institutional framework of remote learning in the country. The government issued a set of regulations, standards and guidelines for the different types of education (in person, remote and hybrid). A platform of online learning (Educa Bolivia) made education content available for students and teachers. An agreement was signed with internet service providers to offer access to the online educational platforms at zero cost (Inter-American Development Bank, 2020a). Additionally, more than 30 community-based radio stations and government TV channels were mobilized to broadcast education lessons. In partnership with a telecommunications company, the Ministry of Education and UNICEF launched Maestros Conectados, an online platform improving the digital skills of around 8,000 teachers that provide remote learning to half a million children across the country (UNICEF, 2020b).

**FIGURE 3.** The percentage of the population having access to electricity in Latin America and the Caribbean (2019), rural vs. urban share

---

**Source:** World Bank Development Indicators, World Bank, 2021b.
in Costa Rica reported challenges with their connectivity at home and that they used their personal cellphone data package to connect with students (COLYPRO, 2020).

Regardless of the modality of remote learning, how it is delivered and used by teachers, students, and families is critically important. A survey in Chile found that just 18 per cent of teachers taught remote classes live, 22 per cent preferred to record the classes and 56 per cent sent materials to students by email or WhatsApp, with teachers reporting that connectivity issues were the main barrier to a more active engagement with students (ECLAC and UNESCO, 2020). Connectivity issues across the region resulted in teachers adopting low-data-consuming platforms for teacher-student interactions. For instance, the use of WhatsApp for teacher-student interactions exceeded 90 per cent of surveyed students in Panama (UNICEF, 2020c) and the Dominican Republic (United Nations, 2020).

If access to a stable internet connection varies across the region, having a device for digital learning has proved to be an extra hurdle for children. In Argentina (UNICEF, 2021b), 40 per cent of households do not have a computer or tablet. In Chile, 66 per cent of the children in private schools can access a computer for schoolwork, in stark contrast to 12 per cent of the children in public schools (Ponce et al., 2020).
Given the digital divide, broadcast media, including television and radio, play a critical role in delivering remote learning in LAC. Out of 33 countries with information in the region, 23 countries have used radio and television to broadcast educational content during school closures (ECLAC and UNESCO, 2020). Close to 9 in 10 households in LAC own a television and around 72 per cent own a radio (UNICEF, 2021a).

In Ecuador, the ‘A-prender la tele’ programme broadcasted education content on language, mathematics, social sciences and natural sciences (UNICEF, 2020a). Widespread access to radio and television in Guatemala has allowed UNICEF and the ministry of education to produce 570 hours of radio and TV educational content (UNICEF, 2020d). In Panama, the programme ‘Leemos un cuento’ broadcasted messages about education for the caregivers of young children up to the age of eight (UNICEF, 2020g). Finally, the remote learning programme, ‘Aprende en casa’, implemented in Mexico, reached 8.2 million students through both TV and radio broadcasts, and a digital platform (UNICEF, 2020f).

Another important element to consider for remote learning is the access to a place to study at home, particularly for the most marginalized. In the region, 5 million households rely on another family for shelter, 3 million live in houses that are beyond repair and 34 million more live in houses suffering from at least one form of deprivation, including shortages of water, sewage, adequate flooring and sufficient space (McTarnaghan et al., 2016). Eighty-seven per cent of students in the highest wealth quintile have a place to study at home, compared with only 74 per cent of students in the lowest quintile.

**FIGURE 5.** The percentage of households with access to TV in Latin American and the Caribbean countries, rural vs. urban share

*Source: Demographic and Health Surveys (DHS) and Multiple Indicator Cluster Surveys (MICS), 2010–2020. Data for Argentina is available only for urban areas.*
wealth quintile (Garcia-Jaramillo, 2020; PISA, 2018). Recent data from Chile indicates that the size of the house matters. In larger houses (with an area above 100 square metres) 80 per cent of children have their own space to study, while only 30 per cent of children living in smaller houses (up to 30 square metres) have their own space to study (Ponce et al, 2020).

**FIGURE 6.** The percentage of households with access to radio in Latin American and the Caribbean countries, rural vs. urban share

*Source: DHS and MICS, 2010-2020.*
Apart from Uruguay, which has been implementing a programme of technology and remote learning in education since 2007 (see Box 2), LAC countries lacked a coherent digital education strategy and the act of deploying remote learning prompted governments to implement some additional policies (Álvarez-Marinelli, 2020). In Colombia, for instance, the remote learning strategy was based on multiple modalities to cater for different needs (see Box 3). According to a survey of ministries of education undertaken in early 2021 (UNESCO, UNICEF, World Bank and OECD, 2021), four in five LAC countries offered information and communication technologies (ICT) training to their teachers. In tackling the challenges of providing remote learning to students in vulnerable groups – such as low income and rural students – 55 per cent of the countries surveyed reported making efforts to subsidize access to smart devices. However, just one quarter (25 per cent) of countries had programmes to improve their access to internet and ICT connectivity.

Recent surveys indicate that private schools in LAC were more prepared to make the transition to remote learning than the public system, potentially widening already existing inequalities in terms of access to, and the quality of, education. For instance, 80 per cent of Chilean children in private schools had daily online classes compared with just 30 per cent of children in public schools (Ponce et al., 2020). In Panama, more children in private education (68 per cent) had access to remote learning than children in public education (59 per cent) (UNICEF, 2020e).

**BOX 2. URUGUAY: A TECHNOLOGY INTEGRATED APPROACH LED BY PLAN CEIBAL**

In Uruguay, classes were suspended on 16 March 2020. On 30 April 2020, reopening of schools began in a staged approach prioritizing rural schools with lower connectivity levels while other more resource-rich schools remained closed as students continued learning remotely. The government provided free internet packages for education purposes and local internet service providers removed data charges for educational platforms (Inter-American Development Bank, 2020b).

The cornerstone of the Uruguayan response is Plan Ceibal (UNICEF, 2020g). The programme, which started in 2007, provides a laptop per child and free internet connection. During the COVID-19 crisis, the programme reached 85 per cent of primary students and 95 per cent of secondary education students, as well as 95 per cent of the teachers (Ripani, 2020). Engagement with online resources from the programme in mathematics, reading, foreign languages and virtual labs saw an increase of 2,452 per cent in March 2020 (Ripani, 2020). Teachers in public schools reported using the online platform to send assignments to students (98 per cent), to provide feedback (87 per cent) and hold videoconferences with other teachers (around 60 per cent). Less frequently, around 30 per cent of teachers reported holding live videoconference lessons with students. Overall, 92 per cent of teachers were very satisfied with the training activities and the support the programme provided (Ripani, 2020).
It is important to remember that schools are more than places for just learning; they are also where children socialize, play and receive nutrition and other critical services (Borkowski et al., 2021). The COVID-19 crisis and the resulting school closures took a toll on the wellbeing and mental health of children. 51 per cent of caregivers in Brazil reported their children lacked the motivation to participate in remote learning activities and 43 per cent of the caregivers feared their children would abandon school altogether (Lemann Foundation, 2020). A phone survey in Ecuador found that 16 per cent of children had scores in a mental wellbeing index equivalent to suffering a major depression and that children declared the lack of in-person schooling and social isolation as the main issues they were facing (Asanov et al., 2020).

The school closures in the wake of COVID-19 have also shown the great need for remote learning systems that can be relied upon when schools are forced to close due to emergencies, whether caused by health, conflict or environmental crises. As climate change continues to increase the frequency and severity of extreme weather events, the resilience of education systems will become even more critical. In LAC, according to the Children’s Climate Risk Index (CCRI), children in Guatemala, Haiti, Honduras, Mexico and Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of) face high risk of climate and environmental shocks (UNICEF, 2021d) (see Figure 7). Recent figures for the region suggest that 55 million children are exposed to water scarcity, 60 million to cyclones and 45 million to heatwaves (UNICEF, 2021e).
FIGURE 7. Harmonized Learning Outcomes by the Children’s Climate Risk Index (0–10)

Note: The CCRI is composed of many indicators across climate and environmental hazards, shocks, and stresses, as well as child vulnerability (UNICEF, 2021f).
School closures due to COVID-19 took place at a time when the region was already experiencing low levels of learning and high numbers of out-of-school children. The closures and the need to transition rapidly to remote learning revealed the inequities in children’s access to technology and connectivity as well as the low levels of training and digital skills of teachers and students. This research explored how countries around LAC responded to these great challenges. Below are recommendations for policymakers and education practitioners in the region to build resilience into education systems:

- **Invest in access to electricity and connectivity for those rural and low-income areas that remain unconnected and without power.** Governments and partners urgently need to invest in reliable, affordable and environmentally resilient electricity and connectivity infrastructure and services to enable equitable remote learning. The places with lower access levels to the technology needed for remote learning are those where students are already falling behind in learning and most vulnerable to shocks. Not investing in this critical infrastructure while education systems increasingly use technology risks widening existing gaps in learning between rich and poor areas.

- **Plan remote learning systems that include different no- and low-tech options to guarantee that all teachers and students can engage in the learning process.** Providing multiple modalities of a remote learning portfolio including digital, broadcast media (TV and radio) and mobile phone-based support in combination with printed materials is critical. As long as a divide in access to technology exists in the region, TV and radio are extremely useful to deliver educational content widely. These different modalities should consider the needs of the teachers and, above all, empower them to find the best solutions to engage meaningfully with students when schools are forced to close.

- **Train teachers to improve the effectiveness of remote learning.** Teachers trained with the skills to incorporate technology in their pedagogy can better adapt lesson plans to remote learning, according to the needs of their students. Teachers with training on formative learning assessments can better monitor their students’ progress and tailor appropriate support or remedial responses. The training of teachers needs to be met with an education management that supports teachers’ continuous improvement in their practice.

- **Develop a national equity-based digital learning agenda and invest in implementation research to learn what works.** The education community in each country should take stock of the lessons learned during the COVID-19 crisis to identify the areas where new policies are needed and where successful experiences can be mainstreamed into the system. In particular, learning the best ways to integrate the use of technologies to support teachers and students from marginalized areas is critical. Embedding research within programmes to learn what works, and improving information systems to monitor learning and identify children in need, are two key steps in developing equitable remote learning programmes that work.
This report was authored by Javier Santiago Ortiz-Correa, Marco Valenza and Thomas Dreesen (UNICEF Office of Research – Innocenti) and Vincenzo Placco (UNICEF Latin America and the Caribbean Regional Office). The authors prepared this report under the supervision and guidance of Linda Jones and Aisling Falconer from UNICEF’s Education Section and Matt Brossard from the UNICEF Office of Research – Innocenti. Valuable inputs were provided throughout the research process by Margarette Sachs-Israel and MiRi Seo from UNICEF’s Latin America and the Caribbean Regional Office. Amparo Barrera and Lara Stefanizzi provided invaluable administrative support to the team. Thanks also goes to Céline Little, Kathleen Sullivan, Sarah Marchant and Silke Rechenbach for their support with the editing and communications of this research.

Special thanks go to the valuable input and comments provided by Teresa Pontual (Executive Manager at the Brazilian Center for Excellence and Innovation in Education Policy) and Nestor López (Educational Policy Consultant in Latin America), who served as external reviewers.

Suggested citation:

Acknowledgements and contact details

UNICEF Office Of Research – Innocenti

The Office of Research – Innocenti is UNICEF’s dedicated research centre. It undertakes research on emerging or current issues in order to inform the strategic direction, policies and programmes of UNICEF and its partners; shape global debates on child rights and development; and inform the global research and policy agenda for all children, particularly for the most vulnerable.

Innocenti publications are contributions to a global debate on children and may not necessarily reflect UNICEF policies or approaches. The findings, interpretations and conclusions expressed in this paper are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of UNICEF.

This paper has been peer reviewed both externally and within UNICEF. The text has not been edited to official publications standards and UNICEF accepts no responsibility for errors.

Requests to utilize larger portions or the full publication should be addressed to the Communications Unit at: Florence@unicef.org


REOPENING WITH RESILIENCE:
Lessons from remote learning during COVID-19 in Latin America and the Caribbean