WOMEN, WORK AND CHILD CARE

INNOCENTI GLOBAL SEMINAR
SUMMARY REPORT

UNICEF International Child Development Centre
Spedale degli Innocenti
Florence, Italy

Prepared by
James R. Himes, Cassie Landers and Joanne Leslie

unicef
United Nations Children's Fund
INNOCENTI GLOBAL SEMINAR

WOMEN, WORK AND CHILD CARE
21-31 October 1991
Casablanca, Morocco

SUMMARY REPORT

UNICEF
International
Child Development Centre
Spedale degli Innocenti
Florence, Italy

Prepared by
James R. Himes, Cassie Landers and Joanne Leslie
Table of Contents

Preface by James Hines ................................................................. 5

I. INTRODUCTION ........................................................................... 9
   • The Major Issues ................................................................ 9
   • Objectives of the Seminar .................................................. 10

II. THE CHANGING CIRCUMSTANCES OF WOMEN'S LIVES .......... 12
   • Women, Households and Families ..................................... 12
     Health and nutrition ......................................................... 12
     Education ........................................................................ 13
     Changing households and family structures ....................... 15
   • Women's Work: A Kaleidoscope of Hidden Costs .............. 18
     • Implications for Child Care ........................................... 21
     Existing child care patterns and practices ......................... 21
     Women's work and child nutrition .................................... 23
     Child care: A call for innovation ....................................... 24

III. WOMEN WORKERS, THEIR FAMILIES AND INTERNATIONAL CONVENTIONS ........................................ 26
   • International Labour Conventions ..................................... 26
     Overview ......................................................................... 26
     The ILO and working mothers .......................................... 27
     Work and family responsibility ......................................... 27
     • Women's Rights and Children's Rights ......................... 28

IV. CHILD CARE AND FAMILY POLICIES IN INDUSTRIALIZED COUNTRIES ............................................ 32
   • Overview ........................................................................ 32
     Policies and Strategies ..................................................... 32
     Care for children aged 0 to compulsory school entry .......... 32
     Child care for children aged 3 to school entry .................. 32
     Infant care: Maternity and/or parenting leave ................... 33
     Toddler care: Parenting, child-rearing benefits and services .. 34
     • A Note on Eastern Europe .............................................. 35

V. CHILD CARE PROGRAMMES IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES: THE NEED FOR A RANGE OF OPTIONS ........... 38
   • The Needs of the Young Child ........................................... 38
   • Programme Availability .................................................. 39
   • Complementary Strategies .............................................. 39
   • Case Studies: Women, Work and Child Care ..................... 42
   • Programme Challenges .................................................. 42

VI. POLICY AND PROGRAMME IMPLICATIONS: TOWARDS AN INTEGRATED APPROACH ........................................... 54
   • Overview ........................................................................ 54
   • Policy and Programming Recommendations .................... 54
     Increasing awareness and improving policy analysis .......... 54
     Strengthening data resources .......................................... 54
     Monitoring, social, legal and regulatory dimensions .......... 56
     Developing national child care and family policies .......... 58
     Creating linkages: Child care and women-in-development initiatives 59
   • Implications for UNICEF and Its Allies ............................ 61

REFERENCES ................................................................................. 63

ANNEX 1. Seminar Themes ............................................................ 67
ANNEX 2. Agenda of the Third Innocenti Global Seminar ............ 69
ANNEX 3. Participants and Invited Speakers ............................... 72
ANNEX 4. Background Reading Materials ................................. 75
ANNEX 5. Programme Framework .............................................. 78
In his Foreword to the Summary Report of the First Innocenti Global Seminar, which dealt with Early Child Development, UNICEF's Executive Director, James F. Grant, outlined six major policy challenges which UNICEF sees in this field (1). The first one, he asserted:

"... is to ensure that a major effort is made to work directly with parents and communities to empower them with knowledge that will increase survival and promote development. Given economic restraints, limited resources must be used to reach the largest number with the most effective approaches. Working with parents and other care-givers must take preference over increased expansion of expensive centre-based programmes which reach relatively few of those in need. Where centre-based programmes are operating, parents and other care-givers must be involved."

In our Preface to the same report, commenting on the results of this June 1989 Seminar, we drew attention to a number of emerging issues and mounting problems facing public-sector action in child development. As we noted there, however, these very problems may also be linked to important elements of a new strategy to direct increased political attention to these issues. The first of the issues cited was the "dramatically increasing number of women entering the labour force worldwide, with grossly inadequate response as regards developmentally appropriate child care from governments, the private sector, communities and fathers".

With these concerns and challenges as background, the choice of the topic for the Third Innocenti Global Seminar, held in October 1991 in Casablanca, was not accidental: "Women, Work and Child Care". Although the difference may seem unduly subtle to some readers, it is also not accidental that the title of this Seminar was not "Women's Work and Child Care". An attempt was made not just to see women in their roles as mothers and providers for their children, or to suggest some inevitable trade-off between 'women's work' and the care of their children, but to explore more thoroughly the complex relations concerning the intersecting needs and rights of women and children.

In a sense, an even more appropriate title might have been "Families, Work and Child Care", partly with the intention of drawing more explicit attention to the increasingly critical roles of men, especially fathers, in the provision of child care and in family and community-based strategies for promoting child survival, protection and development. This point is frequently made, especially by those involved in women's movements, in the industrialized countries. It is less commonly argued in developing countries. But this is changing, and not just within the ranks of a few 'feminist' leaders, who may be viewed as remote from the realities of the 'customs' of their own societies. As our Innocenti Senior Fellow from Sri Lanka, Professor Savitri Goonesekere, remarked in a paper on the situation in South Asia, presented to the Seminar in Casablanca:

"Since child care and family responsibilities are an intrinsic and important aspect of the lives of most women, the challenge is to create an environment conducive to combining their diverse roles in the family and community .... Intrinsic to these efforts is including men in all aspects of meeting this challenge, from policy planning to the actual provision of child care, rather than perceiving women's work exclusively as a women and children's issue .... Women's rights and children's interests can become sharply conflicting interests in the future if the male population in these countries cannot be mobilized to accept shared parental responsibilities (2)."

While frankly recognizing that "much remains to be achieved" in this sensitive area, a Progress Report on women in development and the girl child, to be presented to UNICEF's 1992 Executive Board, more explicitly than most earlier Board documents emphasizes the importance of "men's role and participation in child survival, protection and development (CSPD) activities as well as in the advancement of women ...." (3) This paper cited a key provision of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (Article 5), which
This ‘family/labour force transition’ is a result of many forces, operating quite differently in different cultures and at distinct moments in history. But two relatively common characteristics are the breakdown of the traditional, more extended family structure and the rapid entry of women into the formal and informal labour force. A rough conceptual framework developed at the Innocenti Seminar, largely for programming purposes, suggests one way of looking at key changes in both family structure or function and women’s work environments. Further elaboration of this framework, in different socio-economic situations, may be useful. One of a number of shortcomings of frameworks of this sort, of course, is the absence of a time dimension.

One of the most alarming aspects of the ‘family/labour force transition’ in many developing countries is the remarkable speed with which these changes are taking place. In far less time than one normally associates with significant changes (for example, in fertility rates in developing countries), we are seeing families shifting from traditional, extended forms of social organization to more nuclear or female-headed households with no stable adult male presence. Women are also moving quickly from traditional work in subsistence agriculture and household management to entirely new forms of paid employment, including in export promotion zones and other highly competitive piecework occupations, often linked — precariously — to new economic strategies hardly conceived of less than a generation ago. Trends of this sort, relating also to exceptionally rapid rates of urbanization as well as to national and international migration of both male and female workers, are putting far more than the normal ‘double burdens’ on women with children and with low incomes than are often described in dry terms in the statistics and the literature of national and international agencies.

The report which follows reflects but one step, though we trust a useful one, in UNICEF’s search for improved strategies and programming tools to address the closely intersecting needs and rights of women and children. We hope, among other results, that the October 1991 Innocenti Global Seminar might be followed up by additional policy and action-oriented seminars or workshops at the
regional and country level. Ultimately, the objective is to encourage better analysis of what needs to be done and more effective policies and action to meet the challenges described in this report.

To cite again the Summary Report on the First Innocenti Global Seminar, Jim Grant concluded his Foreword as follows: “How we respond to the needs of children affects the civilization we ourselves comprise, and the one we are helping to build”. This statement acquires powerful additional force when combined with the growing recognition of new opportunities and commitments to advance the human rights and the human development of women — beginning from their infancy and childhood.

*James R. Hines*
Director UNICEF
International Child Development Centre
1. INTRODUCTION

The Major Issues

For the vast majority of women who are mothers, all of their roles, not just the direct bearing of and caring for children, are central to their own welfare and that of their children. Activities such as hauling water, planting crops, buying and selling at the market, doing piecework as a seamstress, working in a factory, or participating in a local women’s group all directly contribute to ensuring a woman’s survival and/or creating opportunities for the future. Fulfilling these multiple roles, however, places enormous demands on women’s time and energy. The impact of a woman’s work on the health and well-being of her children and family is complex, involving a potential for both positive and negative effects. Even at peak capacity she must make complex trade-offs among her various roles. The inevitability of role conflict is underlined by the little-recognized fact that women’s labour force participation peaks in the 25 to 44 year age group, which is also the period when women have the most demanding child care responsibilities (4).

Current trends, including urbanization, industrialization, migration, and expanding access to education, have, to some extent, created new opportunities for women. However, they have also disrupted many familiar cultural practices and survival patterns that women have developed over the years to cope with their multiple responsibilities. One aspect of family life affected by these trends is child care, which is increasingly recognized as an area of critical, unmet need for the healthy development of children and the changing economic and social circumstances of women’s lives.

Throughout this discussion, child care is defined to include behaviours such as breastfeeding and feeding, providing shelter and supervision, and preventing and attending to illness, as well as engaging in social interaction, and providing a stimulating safe environment for play and exploration. Recent research has emphasized that the quality of care, characterized by the motivation, skill, physical capacity, consistency and responsiveness of the caregiver, is strongly linked to child survival and development outcomes. Some authors make a distinction between the types of care that return a child to a previously accepted state of health or development (compensatory care), and those which serve to promote further development, such as language and social development (stimulating care) (5).

In order to simplify definitional inconsistencies, the term ‘child care programmes’ is used broadly to describe a range of services provided to children, for a certain number of hours during the day, and in a safe environment, which contributes to their full development by complementing the family environment and the formal education system. It follows that the type of programme best suited to this purpose will vary according to the age group concerned and the comprehensive nature of services provided, including health, nutrition, and developmentally appropriate learning contexts. How these needs should be satisfied, and the extent to which it is actually possible to do so, varies widely according to the particular characteristics of the child’s environment. In this perspective, ‘child development programmes’ and ‘child care programmes’ are used interchangeably.

Given the inevitability of women’s multiple responsibilities, if accessible, good quality, nonmaternal child care is not available, within or outside the household, both women and children are likely to suffer. In view of this situation, it is rather curious that empirical information from developing countries on how young children are cared for while their mothers work and the effects of caring behaviour on child development, is, at best, scarce and scattered. Unlike the more extensive body of research on the relationship between women’s work and children’s nutritional status, the effect of women’s work on child care and development has not been considered in depth in any of the relevant social sciences or biomedical disciplines (6). The available information appears to be peripheral to other concerns. The data that do exist are not sorted according to the child’s age, a significant shortcoming since the adequacy of a child care method or programme depends to a large extent on children’s developmental needs and capacities. Often based on small samples, the available data provide little insight into the multiplicity of arrangements undertaken over time to ensure child care.

In spite of limited empirical data, the evidence strongly indicates that the current level of child care provision is inadequate to meet the present needs of both mothers and children. Moreover, those con-
cerned with the quality of care both for women and their children maintain that the child care services situation is likely to worsen in developing countries, and that the demand for non-maternal child care will continue to increase while current services may not only fail to expand but actually be reduced. Unfortunately, relevant social and economic factors, combined with the insufficient parenting responsibilities assumed by fathers, support this pessimistic view.

It is clear that the developmental costs of inadequate child care are high. Children lacking appropriate care are exposed more frequently to a clustering of risk factors such as illness, poor nutrition, family stress and unsanitizing environments. The long-term costs can be measured in terms of school dropout, unemployment, delinquency, and the inter-generational perpetuation of poverty and failure.

The period of early childhood provides a window of opportunity, offering an element of hope for even small positive changes in the young child’s environment that can generate long-term benefits. Thus, the increasing child care needs resulting from changes in family structures and women’s work patterns combined with the recognition of the developmental needs of the child provide a powerful argument for governments, employers, communities and families to identify culturally appropriate and affordable solutions to the provision of adequate child care. The need for adequate child care programmes is no longer questioned. The challenge that remains is how and under what circumstances they can be best implemented.

If such programmes are to be implemented and sustained at the level and scale required, they must be accompanied by revisions in family law, employment legislation, social benefit policies and some traditional practices. While cultural norms, personal attachment and perhaps even biological instincts reinforce a mother’s commitment to care for her children, the role and responsibility of fathers must no longer be ignored. Efforts to devise and implement family policy and legislation supportive of shared parental responsibility must be explored. Furthermore, we must look seriously at the opportunities to enhance the complementary rights of both women and children through the implementation of the relevant international conventions. Recognizing the rights granted by these legal instruments will facilitate the progression from an often severely disadvantaged status to one where achievement of the rights and equity for each group is perceived as an interconnected strategy for realizing human potential (2).

**Objectives of the Seminar**

The overall goal of this Third Innocenti Global Seminar was to explore, in light of the variations in conditions and patterns of women’s work, a range of alternative social policies and strategies which simultaneously enhance the social and economic status of working women and the health, nutrition and development of their children. In accomplishing this overall goal, the following objectives were put forth:

1. To review changes in women’s work patterns and family structures as a result of urbanization, industrialization, erosion of real family income and migration; to examine the impact of these changing work patterns on women’s health and development as well as on the developmental status of their infants and young children.

2. To examine the relationship between women’s work and their need for child care within the context of these current trends, and to explore the economic, cultural and sociological barriers that continue to impede the implementation of high-quality child care programmes.

3. To explore a range of alternative social policies and programme strategies which simultaneously address the needs of working women and their children. Participants were exposed to existing social and legislative policies which are critical for a broad implementation of high-quality programmes. Such initiatives were analysed through the discussion of selected case studies, and participants studied the strengths and weaknesses of different policy and programme options.

4. To generate a framework for identifying legislative, policy and programme options available to UNICEF and their collaborators that enhance both the social and economic status of working women as well as their children’s health, nutrition and development.
The Seminar was organized through the joint initiatives of James Himes, of UNICEF's Innocenti Centre, Florence, Italy; Cassie Landers, Consultative Group on Early Child Care and Development, UNICEF, New York; and Alan Silverman, UNICEF Training Section, New York. The Seminar was held in Casablanca, Morocco under the guidance and administration of Nerfissa Zerdourmi, Representative, UNICEF Morocco.

Through a series of invited presentations, plenary sessions, group activities and participant reports, 35 participants from 23 countries discussed the themes outlined in Annex 1. An agenda of the Seminar is presented in Annex 2 and the list of participants and invited speakers can be found in Annex 3. The background reading and reference material are listed in Annex 4.

Corresponding to the Seminar objectives, this Report summarizes several cross-cutting themes. Section II explores the causes and consequences of changes in women's work environments and family structures as well as the impact of these changes on the provision of quality child care. Section III discusses issues related to the social, legal and regulatory dimensions of working women and child care by highlighting relevant provisions in the major international conventions concerning employment and women's and children's rights. Section IV briefly reviews the ways that industrialized nations serve young children and the insights drawn from these experiences. The opportunities and constraints to implementing quality child care programmes in developing countries are reviewed in Section V through an analysis of UNICEF-assisted programmes in Nepal, Ecuador, Ethiopia, Morocco, Peru and Venezuela. Finally, several programmatic and strategic approaches to increasing the availability of affordable, quality child care programmes are analysed in Section VI.

As a seminar report rather than a 'state of the art' review, this report does not attempt to cover all the relevant issues. Among its limitations is an inadequate coverage of the considerable experience of UNICEF and other agencies in developing health, education, income-generating and other programmes for women (3). The Report does, however, seek to bring closer together a number of policy considerations often viewed in isolation: women's needs and rights on the one hand, and those of children on the other.
II. The Changing Circumstances of Women's Lives

Women, Households and Families

Health and nutrition

Rates of maternal mortality show a greater disparity between the developed and developing regions of the world than any other health indicator. Almost all countries in the industrialized world have reduced maternal deaths to very low levels — in some cases close to zero. Dramatic reductions have also been achieved — often with limited resources — in many developing countries, such as Zambia (151 pregnancy-related maternal deaths per 100,000 live births). Many others, however, such as Bhutan (1,310 per 100,000) still have very high rates. Women who become pregnant in many developing countries face a risk of death due to pregnancy that is several hundred times higher than women in industrialized countries (Table 1). The reasons are many and complex, including births unattended by trained personnel, inadequate follow-up services for high-risk pregnancies, and endemic malnutrition among pregnant women. The problem is compounded by sociocultural beliefs, men's attitudes towards and control over women's fertility, illiteracy, early marriage and teenage pregnancy, illegal abortion and food taboos, as well as other traditional practices. Women in these countries bear two to three times as many children as do women in the developed regions. The southern Asian and sub-Saharan African countries have the highest maternal mortality rates — over 500 maternal deaths per 100,000 births — and the largest numbers of births without trained attendants (4).

Women are inadequately nourished, as is the case for about half the women in most of Asia and sub-Saharan Africa, their physical and social development is limited, their health is compromised, and their ability to bear healthy children is threatened (7). Malnourished women get sick more often, have smaller babies and die earlier. Where infant and child mortality is high, birth rates are also high, thereby increasing the stress

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Sub-Saharan Africa</th>
<th>North Africa and Western Asia</th>
<th>South Asia</th>
<th>East Asia, Southeast Asia and Oceania</th>
<th>Latin America and the Caribbean</th>
<th>Industrialized Countries</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fertility rate (1990)</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maternal mortality rate (per 100,000 live births; 1980-1987)</td>
<td>540</td>
<td>290</td>
<td>410</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mothers breastfeeding at one year (1980-1988)</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female literacy rate (%15+; 1985)</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean years of schooling female (25+; 1980)</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women in the labour force (% of total labour force; 1988-1989)</td>
<td>33.1</td>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>21.3</td>
<td>41.5</td>
<td>26.2</td>
<td>39.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

on women’s bodies and trapping them and their children in a cycle of poor health and nutrition.

The majority of women in developing countries suffer from varying degrees of anaemia. Anaemia increases women’s susceptibility to illness, pregnancy complications and maternal death, and contributes to higher overall death rates. Women in their reproductive years require three times as much iron a day as do adult men. Anaemia starves the body of oxygen, making one tired and listless. It also increases the danger of haemorrhaging and other complications related to childbirth. Nearly two thirds of pregnant women in Africa and in southern and western Asia are clinically anaemic, compared with half the women who are not pregnant. Among women aged 15-49 in eastern Asia and in Latin America and the Caribbean, 17-18 per cent are anaemic. In Latin America and the Caribbean, however, anaemia among pregnant women is disproportionately high at 30 per cent, compared with 20 per cent in eastern Asia. For the developed regions, the World Health Organization estimates the rate of anaemia as 11 per cent among all women aged 15-49 and 14 per cent among pregnant women (4).

Iron deficiency is widespread among women in the developing regions and most common in southern Asia and parts of Africa. In India and Mexico, where the preference for sons is strong, girls are often given less protein-rich and iron-rich food than boys of the same age. In Ethiopia, the Sudan and Nigeria, cultural taboos discourage pregnant women from eating fruits, vegetables, milk, rice and other high-calorie foods, thus endangering the mother and unborn child. In many societies it is still the custom for adult women and young children to eat after the men have had their fill, leaving them less of the more nutritious foods. This tendency in some countries for girls and women to eat less food or food with less nutritional value accounts in part for a diminution of the usually longer life expectancy of infant girls at birth compared with boys. The correlation with maternal mortality is clear. A woman stunted from poor nutrition and weakened by anaemia begins pregnancy in a poor condition. Resulting high rates of complications in pregnancy threaten her chances of surviving, and she is more likely to have low-weight babies susceptible to permanent damage from anaemia, iodine deficiency and other nutritional problems (4).

Recently, UNICEF and several other United Nations agencies have begun to pay special attention to the girl child — focusing attention on the health, nutritional, socio-economic and educational discrimination that girls suffer in many developing regions. This discrimination denies girls the stepping stones to a better life, leaving them with little knowledge and training and little chance to improve their condition. Historical patterns of discrimination against girls are evident in long-term statistics comparing women’s mortality rates with men’s. Although current indicators clearly show considerable convergence almost everywhere in female and male mortality rates at the youngest ages, there is strong evidence of higher mortality among girls than boys aged 2-5 in some countries, particularly South Asia.

Although girls contribute much to the family in Africa and Asia — often working seven or more hours a day — many societies consider them a burden. They are discriminated against as children and married early. In addition, some societies expect women to bear children at a very young age. In Mauritania, 29 per cent of girls are married by age 15 and 15 per cent have already given birth. In Bangladesh, 73 per cent of girls are married by age 15, and 22 per cent have had at least one child. Adolescent pregnancy — sometimes the cause of early marriage, and sometimes the result — is very common in some regions. Pregnancy adds an undue burden to an adolescent girl’s maturing body. Teenage mothers have higher rates of maternal and infant mortality. In addition to posing a threat to health, pregnancy can limit a young girl’s chances for education and subsequent employment, thus continuing the cycle of disadvantaged mothers passing on their vulnerability to the next generation.

Education

In assessing the changing circumstances of women’s lives in developing countries, it is important to consider the impact of increased female primary school enrolment rates. Gross primary enrolment rates for girls (which are generally inflated because of over-age children in primary school) are reaching close to 100 per cent in the ‘middle income’ developing countries. Even in low-income countries, however, the enrolment rates for girls increased from about 27 per cent in 1965 to 68 per cent in 1988 (excluding China and India) (8). Achievements in
Aspects of Women's Lives

Roughly one third of all households in the developing world are headed by women, and in some regions, such as the cities of Latin America and the rural areas of some African countries, the percentage is closer to one half.

Women comprise an estimated 32 per cent of the measured labour force in developing countries, the majority in micro-enterprise activities.

In Latin America and the Caribbean, the female labour force numbers 40 million, and by the year 2000 that number will reach 53 million—that is, more than one fourth of the region's total workforce.

In parts of the developing world, such as East Africa, women work up to 36 hours a day doing household chores, preparing food, and growing 60-80 per cent of the family's food, in addition to caring for the children, the elderly, the ill and the disabled in their families.

It is estimated that women farmers grow at least 50 per cent of the world's food, and as much as 80 per cent of the food in some African countries.

Between one third and one half of the agricultural labourers in the developing world are women—a number that is growing as more men migrate to cities to seek employment, leaving women behind to work the land.

Although agriculture represents a steadily declining source of employment for both men and women in developing countries, it still provides on average two thirds of women's paid jobs.

In Africa, where the number of trees felled outpaces new trees planted by a ratio of 29 to 1, women must spend more time, and travel farther, to gather firewood. They often have to walk up to 10 kilometres and spend 5-8 hours every 4-7 days to collect wood or fuel.

Only one in two women in Asia and one in three in sub-Saharan Africa are literate.

The better educated the mother, the less likely the child will die in infancy. Studies from developing countries show that 4-6 years of education is associated with a 20 per cent drop in infant deaths.

many countries regarding the proportion of girls in school are even more remarkable when one takes into consideration the rapid growth rate in the school-age population during recent decades.

While the overall success achieved in female education is indisputable, a closer look reveals that there is still much reason for concern, and even that these changes may have some negative as well as positive effects on women's lives. Firstly, the gap between girls' and boys' participation in schooling remains significant and there has been relatively little change. In 1950, for example, 44 per cent of primary school students were girls, and at the secondary level 42 per cent were girls. By 1985, the percentage of girls had increased only modestly to 45 per cent of students at both the primary and secondary levels. Because of the growth in the school-age population, the gender gap in absolute numbers is actually increasing. In 1950, there were 27 million more boys than girls in primary and secondary school; by 1985 there were 80 million more boys than girls in school. Currently, in developing countries, almost 60 per cent of girls aged 5-19 are still not in school. In addition, there are significant regional differences, both in overall enrolment ratios and in the gender gap. In Latin America and the Caribbean, overall participation of girls in school is over 90 per cent, both as a
ried at older ages than women. Among people aged 60 and older, for example, about 75 per cent of men are married compared with only 40 per cent of women. The net result is that an increasing proportion of older women live alone, again contributing to the decline in average household size.

Migration, both rural-to-urban migration and, to a lesser extent, international migration, has also had a significant effect on family structure, separating male and female partners, as well as one generation from another. With regard to rural-to-urban migration, there seem to be two distinct patterns in the developing world, one in which it is primarily men who migrate to cities, and the other in which primarily women migrate.

In Latin America and the Caribbean, for example, almost two thirds of rural-to-urban migrants are women, over half of whom are under the age of 15. While women migrants have greater economic opportunities in cities, they tend to be extremely vulnerable, both personally and economically, because they leave family and social networks behind and bring few skills and resources with them. The other pattern of rural-to-urban migration, which predominates in sub-Saharan Africa and in most Asian countries, is that of younger men going to cities in search of work, leaving women, children and the elderly on farms and in rural villages. Most women who are left behind in sub-Saharan Africa and Asia find themselves with heavier work loads. Although some receive remittances, many do not.

Interestingly, however, studies from both Egypt and South India have noted that where women are left not only with more work, but also with more decision-making power, their status and self-confidence improves (11). Whether it is women themselves who migrate, their male partners, their children, or entire families, there are few women whose lives have not been influenced by the escalating pace of migration in the developing world.

Both of these trends — declining household size and migration — have contributed to the single most important trend in family structure that has occurred in the last 25 years; that is, the greater number of women-headed households. While there have been, and continue to be, important discussions about how women-headed or women-maintained households should be defined, it is possible to obtain a reasonably accurate minimum estimate of prevalence. Usually, women are recorded in official statistics as heads of household only if they live alone, or if there is no able-bodied adult male living in the household (when present, an adult male is assumed to be the main source of economic support for the household). Even using this relatively conservative definition, almost 30 per cent of households in Latin America and the Caribbean are found to be headed by women, over 20 per cent in sub-Saharan Africa, and about 15 per cent in East and Southeast Asia. In North Africa and in West and South Asia, the proportion tends to be much lower, only around 5 per cent. Between half and a quarter of women heads of household in the developing world are widowed and/or over age 60. Many older or widowed women heading households live alone, while others have responsibility for children and/or grandchildren living with them (4).

While it is important to distinguish among different types of women-headed households (for example, those where women live alone, those where the only other household members are dependent children or elderly, those where there are other able-bodied adults in the household, those which receive remittances) in general, households headed by women are poorer than those headed by men. The disadvantage of women-headed households seems to be much more severe in Latin America and the Caribbean than in other regions, however, which is perhaps linked to the differential patterns of migration discussed above. Most women-headed households in sub-Saharan Africa and Asia, for example, are rural, and it is frequently found that they are no worse off and, indeed, are sometimes better off than male-headed households at approximately the same income level (12) (13). The absence of a male adult from the household does not necessarily have a negative effect, since this change may be accompanied by a remittance greater than or equal to his net contribution to the household when present. A man’s net contribution to the household income is determined not only by the income he earns but also by the share of full household income that he consumes. If a male takes advantage of his superior bargaining power by claiming a disproportionate share of the total income, the household may actually benefit economically from his departure (13).
Nevertheless, in Latin America and the Caribbean, most women-headed households are urban and seem not only to be poorer on average than male-headed households, but less well off at the same income level. Contributing factors are a higher dependency ratio in women-headed households, the more limited types of work available to women, smaller land holdings, fewer secondary earners, and the fact that women's child care and household work constrain the time they have to earn an income and to obtain social services (14).

In considering the effect of family structure on women's lives, not only is it important to take into account the scope of differences in the size and composition of families, it is also essential to recognize that patterns of decision-making and resource flows among co-residential and non-co-residential family members show great variability. The accepted microeconomic model of the family as a cooperative, joint, utility-maximizing unit is increasingly coming under question. It has been found, for example, that income earned or controlled by women is more likely to be used for the benefit of the entire family or children (as opposed to the benefit of the individual income earner) than is the case for male income.

In addition, the combined effects of increasingly monetized economies, greater individual geographic mobility in search of work, and greater mobility and instability in adult sexual relationships seem to have weakened the overall claim of women and children

---

**FIGURE 1**

Women-Headed Households

Up to 30% of households are now headed by women. Nearly half the women heading households in developed regions and at least a quarter in other regions are elderly.

Households headed by women (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>25</th>
<th>30</th>
<th>35</th>
<th>40</th>
<th>45</th>
<th>50</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Developed regions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America and Caribbean</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia and Pacific</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Data mainly refer to early 1980s.

Guatemala: Maternal/Paternal Income and Children’s Nutritional Status

A study in Guatemala of almost 300 peri-urban preschool-age children looked at the differential effects of maternal and paternal income on children’s nutritional status. The study found income pooling between husbands and wives to be uncommon in these communities. The strongest effects were found for maternal income. When mothers earned a larger percentage of total family income, their decision-making power was greater, and the nutritional status of their children was better. While information concerning fathers’ incomes was less reliable (because it was obtained indirectly from mothers) it appeared that, regardless of absolute income level, the more of his total income a father contributed to the family, the better the nutritional status of his children, suggesting that perhaps the importance thing was for fathers to feel committed to their children’s welfare (15).

upon male incomes and support. Since this has not, in most cases, been accompanied by greater government support to women and children, nor by improvements in women’s economic productivity, the consequence has been an increase in the relative poverty of women and children.

The status and role of women living with a male partner is also quite variable. The fact that a woman has a husband or male partner does not necessarily mean that he is a regular economic provider, or even that he is regularly physically present in the home. Decision-making power within the household, while strongly influenced by co-residence and relative economic contribution, is also influenced by many other factors such as age, fertility (in many cultures having borne one or more sons gives women considerable status) and social or kin networks. It is also important to recognize that, in many cultures, not all children have equal claim to family support. Discrimination against female children in South Asia has been widely documented. There is less recognition of the fact that other categories of children, such as later born sons and disabled or illegitimate children, often also suffer from blatantly discriminatory behaviour (16).

Women’s Work: A Kaleidoscope of Hidden Costs

Women’s work is obviously not new; women have always worked. Moreover, women’s work has always been essential to the survival of families, not only their household maintenance work and child care, but also their food production and/or income generation. However, there have been significant changes in the patterns of women’s work. The second half of this century has seen a significant increase in the number of women working in the paid labour force both as a proportion of the total labour force and as a proportion of women of 15 years of age or older. This trend towards increasing labour force participation began earlier and has been most dramatic in the industrialized countries, but has also been significant in developing countries. Although there are important regional and sub-regional variations, available data suggest that between 1960 and 1985 the female labour force participation rate in developing countries as a whole rose from 37 to 42 per cent, and women’s share of the total labour force increased from 28 to 32 per cent (17). In addition, these figures undoubtedly represent a lower bound on the true extent of women’s current economic participation. Difficulties associated with defining and categorizing non-salaried economic activity, as well as cultural preconceptions about the appropriate economic role for women, allow for a systematic and large underestimation of the scope of women’s contribution to the economy (4) (18).

In spite of their limitations, available data highlight important regional differences in the extent of the increase in women’s labour force participation as well as the types of work that have accounted for
How Women Spend their Time

The lives of most women throughout the world, particularly poor women, are characterized by long hours of work, multiple responsibilities and limited opportunities. Global averages based on time allocation studies from both industrialized and developing countries indicate that women divide their long work day approximately equally between household work (including child care) and labour force participation (broadly defined), with additional, but not well-quantified hours, devoted to unpaid community work.

Hours per week spent by women on different types of work:*  
- Household Work — 36 hours  
- Economic Activity — 39 hours  
- Unpaid Community Work — n/a  
- Total Work Time — 75+ hours

The fact that women's household work, as well as many of the most common economic activities undertaken by women, tend to be undervalued in terms of remuneration and recognition simultaneously reflects and contributes to women's lower status and more limited opportunities, in comparison with men.


most of the increase (see Table 1). The highest levels of economic participation on the part of women are found in East and Southeast Asia, where 50 to 60 per cent of women aged 15 or over are economically active, and where women represent 40 per cent of the total labour force. However, these proportions have risen little if at all over the last 20 years, and agriculture continues to provide the main source of work for women in Asia. In contrast, urban growth has significantly changed economic opportunities for women in Latin America and the Caribbean, where the percentage of women who are economically active rose from 26 to 32 per cent between 1970 and 1990, with service sector jobs accounting for the large majority of the increase.

In sub-Saharan Africa, the percentage of economically active women is high, but appears to have actually declined from slightly above to slightly below 50 per cent in the period since 1970. Not only are the vast majority of economically active women in sub-Saharan Africa, as in Asia, working in agriculture, but unlike other regions, a significantly smaller proportion of economically active women than men are wage earners. In North Africa and Western Asia, the most striking aspect of the phenomenon is the low level of women's participation in the overall labour force (under 20 per cent), although even in these countries there has been a notable increase in the percentage of economically active women as well as in women's share within the total labour force.

The changing economic environment in most countries over the second half of this century as a result of greater industrialization, urbanization and increased international trade has presented women with new challenges. Until 1980, it might have been appropriate to emphasize the new opportunities opening up for women in developing countries. However, the economic recession waves and rising
indebtedness that have characterized most national economies in the 1980s have primarily brought women painful choices, and desperate efforts focused on day-to-day survival.

 Particularly in recent years, women's increased economic activity has been not so much a response to a wider range of opportunities for women as a response to the erosion of family incomes. Faced with reduced access to male-generated incomes, which are themselves declining in much of the world, more women are entering the labour force and working for longer hours than ever before. Unfortunately, given the constraints on women's productivity due to their limited skills, lack of access to credit, and the demands on their multiple responsibilities, most women have no way of increasing their economic contribution except by increasing the number of hours they work. The necessity of working longer hours further reduces women's opportunities for the acquisition of skills, and may impair their health and nutritional status, thus setting up a vicious cycle in which lower productivity leads to even more desperate efforts to increase hours of work. Women's work burden has increased in recent years not only because rising poverty has forced them to devote more time and effort to income generation, but also because they have had to put more time into household maintenance and caregiving in response to a decline in public and private social and health services combined with the erosion of traditional family support that has taken place in most countries (20).
and insecurity associated with women’s work has been accompanied by a fall in men’s employment as well as by a transformation or feminization of many jobs traditionally held by men (21).

Economists have proposed several explanations for the increase in women’s labour force participation and simultaneous decrease in male participation. Outward-oriented development strategies based on export-led industrialization have brought a rapid growth of low-wage female employment. A rise in the female proportion of productive wage workers has been observed in all countries that have pursued the export-led industrialization strategy, including the Dominican Republic, El Salvador, Honduras, Hong Kong, Republic of Korea, Malaysia, Mexico, Philippines, Singapore, Sri Lanka and Thailand. Indeed, no country has successfully industrialized or pursued this development strategy without relying on a massive expansion of female labour. In the Export Processing Zones (EPZ) of many industrializing countries, it is not uncommon for as many as three quarters of all employees to be women (21).

Many of the reasons for the feminization of the labour pool are well known. Much of the assembly and production work is semi-skilled and low paid. The social and economic oppression of young women, particularly in Asia, has resulted in ‘low aspiration’ and ‘low efficiency’ waged. Women are prepared to work long hours for low wages, and when their productivity declines they are quickly replaced by new and vulnerable cohorts. Most of these women begin with no skills, acquire no skills on the job, have no health, maternity or pension benefits and no job security. They are constantly at high risk of losing their employment, and once they do, factors such as age, child care responsibilities, or poor health limit their ability to find alternative employment (21).

Another aspect of the structural adjustment strategy affecting women’s employment patterns is labour market deregulation. As of late 1990, 109 countries had ratified the International Labour Organisation (ILO) Equal Remuneration Convention No. 100. In a disproportionate number of countries with large export processing zones, including Hong Kong, Republic of Korea, Sri Lanka and Thailand, the Convention has not been ratified. Other countries, such as India, have gender-based minimum wage requirements in certain industries on the grounds that women perform less arduous work. It is no coincidence that this shifting pattern is closely related to the erosion of labour regulations. There has been explicit deregulation, in which formal regulations have been eroded or abandoned by legislative actions, and an implicit deregulation, characterized by inadequate implementation or systematic bypassing of existing regulations (21).

In general, stabilization and adjustment strategies have resulted in a deflation of aggregate demand, leading to higher unemployment in the more formal sectors and widespread resort to informal survival strategies among the poor, particularly in urban areas. The result has been that both men and women have increasingly turned to self-generated employment in the informal sector either as a supplement to formal sector earnings or as their sole source of support. Women have long been concentrated in such informal activities, both as petty traders or ‘pre-entrepreneurs’ and as dependent wage workers in family enterprises. Very little has been done to enhance the status and living standards of such workers.

The overall trend towards increased economic participation on the part of women has occurred throughout the world, and seems likely to continue, perhaps even at an accelerated pace, given the recent shift to increasing numbers of export-led, market-oriented national economies. However, as this brief review indicates, what might appear to be economic gains for women in the changing labour market are offset by pervasive and continuing job insecurity, often combined with a need to work longer and more burdensome hours. As the next section makes clear, these trends have posed painful dilemmas for women with child care responsibilities.

Implications for Child Care

Existing child care patterns and practices

Just as the fact that women’s work in developing countries is by no means new, neither is the use of non-maternal child care to supplement maternal child care in developing countries. Sources of non-maternal child care can be divided roughly into four
types. The first and unfortunately not infrequent child care arrangement used throughout the world, in spite of the hazards involved, is 'non-existent' child care — children are simply unattended while the mother is otherwise occupied. The second is child care provided by other members of the mother's household, frequently older siblings. The third pattern involves reciprocal exchanges of child care or other services, among members of a residential or kin group, usually without any financial compensation. The fourth type is a combination of formal and informal child care services, where child care is provided for a fee, at home (either the home of the child or the provider) or in an institutional setting (22).

It is important to note that, although it is widely assumed that traditional patterns of women’s work have been and continue to be easily combined with child care responsibilities, this is not always the case. Many tasks associated with home maintenance and subsistence agriculture involve women travelling considerable distances, sometimes carrying heavy loads. Women frequently choose to leave older preschool children behind, and in some cultures even to leave nursing infants behind, out of concern for dangers to which the child might be exposed, or because they would be excessively slowed down in their work (23). Nonetheless, historically, the location of much of women’s work in or near their homes, the likelihood that they lived with or near extended families, and the presence of older children at home throughout much of the day all helped women to accommodate their other responsibilities, and still ensured that minimally adequate care and supervision was provided to their children. The changing circumstances of women’s lives have made many of the traditional options for child care either unavailable or unsuitable.

The trend towards greater labour force participation on the part of women in the developing world, and the trend, in some regions, towards a larger proportion of women working in salaried jobs have undoubtedly increased the number of women experiencing incompatibility between economic activities and simultaneous child care. The type of work and/or the location of the work often makes it difficult, dangerous, or prohibited to bring a child along. Sometimes problems associated with transportation to work (either the reliance on travel by foot in rural areas, or the crowded means of public transport that women must use in many large urban centres) present even more of a barrier than the type of work itself to women bringing their children to the work site. Some of the most desirable employment options for women (either because they are less arduous, such as retail or clerical work, or they are well paid, such as some factory and assembly line jobs) are precisely the ones that mothers of young children cannot even consider, unless they have access to reliable child care. Even where there is no apparent incompatibility, for instance women doing outwork at home or working as traders in the market, concurrent productive work and child care may be problematic and unsatisfactory to both mother and child.

Changes in family structure, as well as the fact that an increasing proportion of families live in urban settings, have created their own set of child care dilemmas. Child care problems associated with rural-to-urban migration are due not only to the greater pressure experienced by women in cities to generate income, and the greater probability that urban women will have formal sector jobs, but also to the fact that the normal pattern in rural-to-urban migration is for some, but not all, members of an extended or even nuclear family to migrate to the city. Thus, women are faced with the need to enter the labour force, but lack the kin network to which they might have been able to turn for child care. Sometimes residential support networks can replace kin networks in urban areas, but there will still be a difficult period of formation after each new move. It takes time for women to feel both the right to ask for assistance in child care, and confidence in the quality of care that non-family arrangements will provide.

Household size and composition (or family structure) are relevant to child care both because they determine the availability of non-maternal child caregivers close at hand as well as the extent to which women feel that they have a choice about whether and how much to be economically active. Declining fertility rates and reduced average household size mean that women tend to have both fewer older children and fewer other adults in the household to assist in the provision of child care. Small households in general, and women-headed households in particular, may be even more disadvantaged than it appears. They may be less likely to have established strong positions within a kin or residential network since they have limited time or
resources to provide reciprocal services. The impact of the trend towards greater participation of girls in schooling, while beneficial overall in its effects on the health, status and opportunities for girls and women, has reduced the availability of sibling care for preschool-age children.

**Women’s work and child nutrition**

In spite of the magnitude of the changes taking place, data on the effect of changes in family structure and women’s work environments on child development are scarce and scattered. In contrast, the relationship between women’s work and one specific aspect of development, namely child nutrition, has received more in depth analysis. The following section highlights the policy insights evolving from a summary analysis of available empirical evidence (6). Although the forces at work are complex and sometimes conflicting, the findings thus far do not suggest that maternal employment has a negative effect on child nutrition, as measured either in terms of infant feeding practices or child nutritional status. Unless there is strong reason to believe that the situation is different for other aspects of child development, policies that directly or indirectly limit employment opportunities for women in developing countries cannot be justified on the grounds that children’s welfare will be enhanced by mothers remaining out of the paid labour force.

Of the 28 studies from 20 developing countries reviewed by Leslie, few found a significant relationship between women’s work status and infant feeding practices. Survey data, supported by ethnographic information where available, strongly suggest that the majority of working women want to breastfeed their infants and, in most cases, they succeed in doing so, at least during the critical first six to nine months. However, regardless of location or type of work, working mothers appear to introduce breastmilk substitutes relatively early, and in most but not all cases, earlier than non-working mothers.

Studies investigating the relationship between women’s work and child nutritional status found more

---

**FIGURE 2**

Beneficiaries of Child Care Programmes: Women, Their Work and Their Children

---

- **Women’s Work**
  - Household, Market, Community
  - Income
  - Technical and material conditions
  - Time allocation
  - Energy expenditure
  - Absence from home
  - Exposure to hazards
  - Control/access to resources

- **Women’s Status**
  - Physical health
  - Nutrition
  - Education and beliefs
  - Psychological health
  - Social support network
  - Decision-making status

- **Child Development**
  - Health
  - Nutrition
  - Psychological health
  - Social support network
  - Safety
  - Protection
evidence of a significant association, and more cause for concern about a possible negative effect of women's work, than did the studies that looked at women's work and infant feeding practices. A number of studies that compared the nutritional status of children of employed and non-employed mothers found a negative association between maternal employment and child nutritional status, though none demonstrated a causal relationship. Most researchers apparently assumed that mother's work was the determinant and child nutritional status the outcome, without examining the alternative explanation that concern for her child's nutritional status might have motivated the mother to seek work in the first place.

Not only are the studies that found a negative association between maternal employment and child nutritional status open to more than one interpretation, but there are also a number of studies that found a positive relationship between women's work and child nutrition. Several studies found better nutrient intake among children whose mothers worked, particularly among children of higher-income working mothers. In some cases, better nutrient intake was reflected in better child growth, although the effects were not consistent and not usually substantial. Two particularly interesting studies disaggregate results by age of the child. Both found evidence of a negative association between maternal work and child nutritional status for infants and a positive association for weaning-aged children.

Findings concerning most of the specific work-related variables such as location, amount of time worked or type of occupation, are quite inconsistent and do not lead to any easy generalizations. However, one possibly important factor is the age of substitute child caregivers. Few of the studies explicitly considered this issue, but those that did consistently found that children who were cared for by an adult when their mothers were working had better nutritional status than children cared for by another child.

Given the lack of consistent research findings and the fact that few of the studies were specifically designed to investigate the relationship between women's work and child nutrition, it is clear that further and better research is needed. Perhaps the most important lesson for future research that emerges from this review is the importance of carefully defining and measuring the key variables. Future research should pay particular attention to how women's work is measured. In most cases, simply dividing women into categories of employed and non-employed is not sufficient. Care should be taken to avoid using an exclusive definition and to avoid clustering different groups such as subsistence farmers, women who work at home, women with intermittent informal-sector work and women with regular formal-sector jobs. In many cases, non-working women will also need to be disaggregated, particularly when analysing their socio-economic status vis-a-vis working women in the sample. It is quite likely that in some settings non-working women will be better off than working women, while in other settings working women will be in a better position. This point will need to be clarified in order for results to be interpreted meaningfully. Another neglected issue requiring careful consideration in analysing the relationship of women's work to child nutrition is the availability and quality of substitute caregivers together with information on the age distribution of the children.

Child care: A call for innovation

It is clear that the inconsistent research findings on the relationship between women's work and child nutrition not only reflect methodological and definitional weaknesses, but also underscore the complexity of the relationship through which women's work affects the development of young children. As suggested in Figure 2, factors that influence the quality of child care include maternal health and nutrition, education, child development beliefs and values, social support systems, quality of substitute caregivers, and intra-familial status and decision-making power. As discussed by Seminar participants, the degree to which these maternal variables are operative is directly influenced by the characteristics and circumstances of women's work, including, but not limited to: income, technical and material conditions of production, energy expenditure, time allocation, absence from home, exposure to hazards, and control over and access to resources (5) (6).

As women inevitably shoulder multiple responsibilities, the lack of good quality non-maternal child care will negatively affect both women and children, but also may have broader negative consequences. Figure 2 illustrates how child care programmes have the potential to exert a direct and positive influence on at least three groups of beneficiaries. In the first
instance, employers who provide access to child care facilities benefit from decreased absenteeism and an increase in labour force productivity and responsibility. Moreover, the availability of child care has the potential to increase the productivity of self-employed women as well as those engaged in agricultural activities. Women's own health and psychological status can be dramatically improved by decreasing the stress associated with inadequate child care arrangements. Perhaps the most powerful beneficiary is the young child whose critical needs for health, nutrition, safety, protection and early learning can be supported and enhanced through the provision of both formal and informal child care arrangements. Importantly, child care programmes have the potential to release girl siblings from the burden of child care responsibilities, thus affecting the rates of primary school enrolment, retention and performance.

Women's increased vulnerability resulting from market deregulation plus insecure and poorly paid work situations and the erosion of supportive social and family networks, combined with increased recognition of the developmental needs of the young child, provide a powerful argument for governments, employers, communities and families to identify affordable solutions to the provision of adequate child care. The need for supplementary child care arrangements is no longer questioned. The challenge that confronts us all is how and under what circumstances quality services can be implemented and sustained. Before reviewing the range of programming options available to UNICEF and its partners, the Seminar participants explored the capacity of existing international legal Conventions to provide social, legal and regulatory support for programmes addressing the intersecting needs of women and children. A review of the International Labour Organisation's policies regarding the care of workers' children as well as relevant articles contained within the recent Conventions concerning the rights of women and children are summarized in the following section.
III. Women Workers, Their Families and International Conventions

International Labour Conventions

Overview

A wide range of international labour and related social issues are regulated through standards provided by the International Labour Organisation (ILO). International labour standards are contained in Conventions and Recommendations adopted by the International Labour Conference. Conventions are comparable to multilateral international treaties; once ratified they create specific, binding obligations. Recommendations offer non-binding guidance in the implementation of the principles contained in the corresponding Convention. Most ILO Conventions and Recommendations are gender neutral. The rights of all workers are equally addressed by standards adopted in conventions concerning basic human rights, conditions of work, social security, employment and labour relations. However, in certain circumstances, standards which focus specifically on the work of women have been adopted. The following discussion outlines the evolution of the ILO’s specific legislation regarding the protection and promotion of women workers (24) (25) (26).

Standards applying to women workers were included, for example, in the Underground Work (Women) Convention (no. 45), 1953, and the Night Work (Women) Convention (Revised) (no. 89), 1948. Provisions contained in other instruments gave priority to women in the reduction of work hours and the provision of work place facilities. These early standards reflected the existing attitudes towards the capacity and appropriate role of women in society. They reflected a ‘protectionist’ approach, perceiving women as requiring special protection from long, dangerous and arduous work.

A major shift in emphasis took place in 1958 with the adoption of the Discrimination, Employment and Occupation) Convention and Recommendation (No. 111). With 109 ratifications, the Convention is one of the most widely ratified. These standards addressed discrimination issues in both public and private sectors on the grounds of race, colour, sex, religion, political opinion, national extraction or social origin. The 1958 Convention called upon states to design and adopt national policies to promote, by methods appropriate to national conditions and practice, equality of opportunity and treatment in employment and occupation. However, distinctions, exclusions or preferences included in earlier standards were not declared to be discriminatory under the Convention.

In 1975, concern was expressed about the relationship between equality of opportunity and treatment and the protective measures contained in early ILO standards. This relationship was examined in more detail by the International Labour Conference in 1985 (27) (28). Different views prevailed. Some members argued that special protective measures should be kept to a minimum; others proposed that they should be strengthened in order to achieve full equality. Some expressed the view that measures designed to promote equality should not jeopardize the rights of women already achieved, while others were concerned that special rights could lead to further discrimination. Arguing from a sociological perspective, some members highlighted that the massive entry of women into the work force was irreversible. From their perspective, the major challenge was to modify the distribution of tasks within the family and raise women’s consciousness of their roles and potential. Progress was seen as depending on women’s recognition of the extent of existing gender discrimination and efforts to change traditional attitudes and societal roles.

In 1989, a Meeting of Experts concluded that measures should be taken in all countries to review all protective legislation applying to women in the light of up-to-date scientific knowledge and technological changes, and to revise, supplement, extend, retain or repeal such legislation according to national circumstances; it addressed a similar recommendation to the ILO in connection with its own protective standards (29).

It should be stressed that, throughout this debate, the need for measures to protect the reproductive function of women was never questioned and the importance of protecting the reproductive function of men was also noted.

Following its occupational safety and health strategy, the ILO has moved towards a needs-based, gender-neutral approach to working conditions based on the abilities and needs of individual workers,
rather than on their sex. Potential employees should be assessed according to the tasks they may be expected to perform. The intent is to identify sources of potential hazards or harm to both men and women in order to ensure that precautions are taken to protect all workers in relation to their specific needs. In light of this position, it is unlikely that the ILO will adopt gender-specific standards regarding conditions of work. The ILO, nevertheless, recognizes the need for special legislation in sectors dominated by women, including home-work and part-time work.

The ILO and working mothers

Protection of maternity and reproduction are contained in the Maternity Protection Convention (No. 103), 1952 and Recommendation (No. 95). The Convention deals with maternity protection in terms of maternity leave and benefits as well as job and income security. Measures regarding special conditions of work for pregnant women or nursing mothers are contained in the Recommendation. The Convention applies to women employed in industrial and commercial undertakings, other non-industrial and agricultural occupations and to those engaged in domestic work or home-work. The terms apply to any pregnant woman irrespective of age, nationality, race or creed, marital status, and irrespective of whether the child is born out of marriage (26) (30).

Maternity leave is one of the most basic forms of protection for working women. It allows time for rest during the last weeks of pregnancy and for care of the newborn child. It also guarantees a continuing source of income and employment security following delivery. Article 3 of the Convention explicitly confirms the right of every woman worker to maternity leave. National policies which limit eligibility to full-time workers and thereby exclude part-time workers contravene this requirement. While the duration and distribution of maternity leave vary widely, women are entitled to a period of at least 12 weeks, of which at least six are taken following delivery. After a woman returns to work, Article 6 provides for nursing breaks; in practice, these average 60 to 90 minutes per day.

Maternity protection provisions also include cash benefits to compensate for the loss of earnings due to suspension of the employment contract and to provide medical benefits including prenatal and postnatal care. To avoid discrimination against women that might result if employers were required to pay for maternity benefits, the Convention asserts that employers shall not be individually liable for the cost of such benefits. Article 4 of the Convention provides for a level of cash benefits of not less than two thirds of the woman’s previous earnings. The amount of benefits generally varies from 50 to 100 per cent of previous earnings or is determined by a wage ceiling fixed by social security. Contrary to these ILO standards, benefits are sometimes expected to be fully paid for by the employer. This practice encourages employers to evade their obligations and is a major obstacle to women obtaining maternity benefits, especially in developing countries.

As specified in Article 6 of the Convention (No. 103), it is unlawful for an employer to dismiss a woman during her maternity leave entitlement. A large number of countries provide protection against dismissal during maternity leave, while others provide employment security throughout pregnancy. In some instances, however, a woman can be dismissed on grounds unrelated to pregnancy.

The protective measures contained in the Convention (No. 103) are complemented and reinforced by protective health measures contained in other ILO Conventions and Recommendations. For example, Maternity Protection Recommendation (No. 95) prohibits night work and overtime work for pregnant and nursing women and provides for adequate rest periods. The Recommendation also advises that work harmful to women’s health should be prohibited.

Work and family responsibility

The ILO has long recognized that women workers could be penalized if they alone are expected to cope with child care and other domestic concerns. The ILO’s first action specifically directed at the problems of workers with family responsibilities took place in 1965 with the adoption of the Employment (Women with Family Responsibilities) Recommendation (No. 123) (31). This Recommendation supports a woman’s right to work outside the home without discrimination. To accomplish this objective, the Recommendation recognizes that services and facilities enabling women to balance work and family responsibilities are necessary. An important shift
of emphasis is evident towards recognizing joint and shared parental responsibility. This shift is clearly reflected in the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All forms of Discrimination Against Women, 1979. This Convention reinforces earlier concerns on the needs of both women and children by recognizing the “common responsibility of men and women in the upbringing and development of their children, it being understood the interest of the children is the primordial consideration in all cases”. It also notes that “a change in the traditional role of men as well as the role of women in society and in the family is needed to achieve full equality between men and women”.

In responding to the need to strengthen protection for all workers with family responsibilities and to encourage work places where men as well as women have the choice and opportunity to respond to parental duties, the ILO adopted the Workers with Family Responsibilities Convention, 1981 (No. 156) and replaced the Employment (Women with Family Responsibilities) Recommendation (No. 123) with the Workers with Family Responsibilities Recommendation, (No. 165). Convention 156 requires member states to design national policies which encourage non-discriminatory employment of workers with family responsibilities. Measures to be considered include recognition of workers’ needs in terms and conditions of employment, social security, and the provision of child and family care services and facilities. Additional considerations are elaborated in Recommendation (No. 165) and include: reduced work time and overtime, flexible work schedules, parental leave and leave to care for sick children, and shift and night work. By 1990, the Convention had been ratified by 18 countries, including seven developing countries.

Thus, the initial goal of maternity protection legislation in order to protect the health of women and unborn children has expanded in response to a broader range of gender equality and treatment issues.

**Women’s Rights and Children’s Rights**

The Seminar was not specifically focused on issues of children’s rights, but there are several aspects of this area of concern which are highly relevant. A paper by one of the participants dealt with “Women’s Work and Child Rights in South Asia: Conflicting Interests or Complementary Strategies” (2). The title itself suggests the particular relevance of some children’s rights issues to the purposes of this Seminar. Is the Convention on the Rights of the Child in conflict with the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (32)? Does the former deal only with women in their roles as mothers and primary providers of child care and protection, to the exclusion, or at least to the prejudice, of their own rights? Where are the strongest elements of complementarity between these two Conventions, particularly as they may relate to working women and child care?

By way of background, it is important to note that the Convention on the Rights of the Child, though still to be tested in terms of practical implementation, is widely viewed by UNICEF and other institutions concerned with human rights as a very promising ‘newcomer’ to the field of international human rights law and advocacy. A report to UNICEF’s 1991 Executive Board (33) notes that the Convention has been described by the United Nations Centre for Human Rights as “the most complete statement of children’s rights ever made”. In addition, the Board paper goes on to assert that it may be “the most comprehensive and, in many of its provisions, the most innovative human rights instrument to be drafted by the international community”. Among the innovative features cited is the fact that “it charts new territory by introducing the legal concept of children’s participation in the decisions affecting their lives and it underscores the importance of international cooperation for its implementation”. It also marks “a turning point away from the traditional compartmentalization of human rights into civil and political rights on one hand, and economic, social and cultural on the other”.

Of particular interest in terms of the topic of the Seminar are the innovative features concerning monitoring and implementation, including specific provisions for public information and awareness creation — one of the most powerful tools available in human rights work. Article 42, for example, requires States which have ratified (numbering 114 as of March 1992) “to make the principles and provisions of the Convention widely known, by appropriate and active
means, to adults and children alike. UNICEF and other institutions have already moved vigorously in many countries to assist both governments and NGOs to begin this process. Of special importance, including for advocacy and "social mobilization" for children's rights, is Article 44 (6) requiring States to make their reports on measures taken to implement the Convention "widely available to the public in their own countries".

Speaking to UNICEF's 1991 Board, Mr. Jan Martinsson, then the United Nations Under-Secretary-General for Human Rights, stated: "The most revolutionary element of UNICEF's approach to the implementation of the Convention is the integration of the principles of the Convention into country programmes and analyses. For the first time the United Nations brings fully to bear on its practical activities, international standards of human dignity."

In sum, it seems clear that the stage has been set for approaching the implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child in a broader human rights context rather than only as an advocacy and programming tool for children. A remarkable number of countries have already ratified. The fact that the Convention has entered into force so widely, and at a time of exceptional opportunities for advancing human rights and more participatory forms of democracy throughout the world, should encourage this broader approach. Furthermore, UNICEF has already, in many of its policy statements and country programmes, demonstrated a significant concern for the multiple roles of women in society; and this will help to ensure that this "lead agency for children" in the United Nations family develops an approach to its role in implementing the Convention on the Rights of the Child which is equally sensitive to the needs and rights of women.

Referring more specifically to the relationship between this Convention and the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, it was pointed out during the Seminar that both Conventions have a very similar value base regarding the family and the relationship between the child, the family and the State. Both reflect the concept of joint and shared parental responsibilities, as well as rights, in a context of gender equity. It is especially important to stress that the Convention on the Rights of the Child consistently refers to "parents" and Article 18 provides that "both parents have common responsibilities for the upbringing and development of the child". This same article, while providing that parents have the primary responsibility for the upbringing and development of the child, adds that the State "shall render appropriate assistance to parents and legal guardians in the performance of their child-rearing responsibilities and shall ensure the development of institutions, facilities and services for the care of children". Both Conventions are clearly concerned with the development of family policy by the State that will make the public sector supportive of the provision of child care and the equitable treatment of all family members.

It is interesting to note that, far from undervaluing the role of women (or men) in child care, the Convention concerning discrimination against women actually postulates a higher standard regarding the "best interests of the child" (an important legal provision in both instruments) than the Convention on the Rights of the Child. The latter (Article 3, especially) refers to the commitment of States Parties to ensure that the child's best interests are "a primary consideration". The Convention concerning women's rights refers to these interests as a "paramount" and "primordial" consideration. The difference may turn out to be of limited practical importance, but it helps to overcome simplistic interpretations which suggest sharply different approaches to family or parent-child relations in the two Conventions.

Although it is difficult and sometimes inappropriate to analyse specific articles of the Convention on the Rights of the Child in isolation from other articles, in view of its "holistic" approach to children's rights, there are at least two provisions which are of special interest in terms of the issues reviewed at the Seminar. Particularly important is the last clause of Article 38 (the first two have been cited earlier):

"States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to ensure that children of working parents have the right to benefit from child care services and facilities for which they are eligible." 

\[1\] The word "mother" appears only once in a reference in Article 24 to ensuring appropriate pre-natal and post-natal health care.
On first reading, especially with its ominous reference to "eligibility", this provision may appear to be of more immediate relevance to industrialized than to developing countries. As noted elsewhere in this Report, however, the experience of a number of developing countries (both 'middle-income', such as Colombia, Turkey and Venezuela, and 'low-income', including China, India and Nepal) suggests considerable potential for a gradual extension of "eligibility" for early child care and integrated child development programmes to reach increasing proportions of those countries' low-income families. In those (still all too few) cases where special efforts have been made to take into account situations where the burdens of work, including child-rearing, on women are especially severe, there is certainly considerable potential for using the "child-care services and facilities" provisions of the Convention for firm advocacy and concerted action to address one of the major issues concerning "women, work and child care" throughout the world.

Perhaps less obviously relevant in this connection, but nevertheless very important, is the provision of the Convention on the Rights of the Child concerning child labour. The most direct link stems from the fact that many (and probably increasing numbers in some countries) of the working women we are concerned with here are in fact children — certainly in terms of the legal definition of the child in the Convention of less than 18 years of age (Article 1), "unless, under the law applicable to the child, majority is attained earlier". In addition, although the data are often weak, it appears that there is increasing substitutability between female workers and child labourers in some developing countries as a result of economic crises and/or structural adjustment programmes. Particularly worrisome are situations in which mothers (often in women-headed households) are being forced by economic pressures to depend increasingly not only on their own income-generating capacities but also on those of their school-age children. Many kinds of 'non-formal' and piece-rate employment arrangements, often through highly exploitative intermediate contractors, described earlier in this Report, can be especially injurious in terms of pressures on children as well as mothers to increase their work hours far beyond their reasonable capacities.

As far as the pertinent provision of the Convention on the Rights of the Child is concerned (and there are many other international and national laws and covenants concerning this complex and controversial subject), it is relevant to note that Article 32 does not attempt to "abolish" all child labour (if that concept has any useful meaning), but rather to protect children:

"... from economic exploitation and from performing any work that is likely to be hazardous or to interfere with the child's education, or to be harmful to the child's health or physical, mental, spiritual, moral or social development."

It may also be worth noting, however, that Article 32 on child labour contains a strongly worded provision regarding the obligation of the ratifying State to "provide for appropriate penalties or other sanctions to ensure the effective enforcement of this article". For the ILO, UNICEF and other concerned organizations, official and non-governmental, this clause provides some potentially powerful 'teeth' to help ensure that the Convention's approach to child labour does not become an excuse to hide exploitative, hazardous and otherwise detrimental employment of children behind a new cloak of international legitimacy.

Following a useful review of various 'critiques' identified against an active strategy for combating child labour, the ILO's Assefa Bekele concludes that poor countries:

"... can and should prohibit the employment of children in hazardous activities and occupations which are manifestly dangerous to the safety, health and physical, emotional and moral development of the child. They can and should prohibit the employment of the very young and vulnerable. They can and should ensure the provision of universal, compulsory

and free education for all their children, especially those under 12 or 13 years of age."

"The objectives I set out above are not unattainable. Indeed they are very modest and feasible even in very poor countries. The problem is not economic or administrative feasibility, but one of national and political commitment. And it is for us — those in international organisations, in the media and in non-governmental organisations — to mobilise national and community pressure so that governments live up to their national and international obligations to ensure that the child is protected at home, on the street and at the workplace (34)."

As the Seminar participants were all too aware, in many instances the short-term consequences of more aggressive actions, both to enforce child labour laws and compulsory primary education requirements may, in fact, be to increase the burdens on the time, energy and incomes of low-income working women. A key policy question therefore becomes: How can effective, affordable and sustainable ways to support these women be found so that, among other outcomes, their children can exercise their rights to attend school and to be protected from detrimental employment?
IV. Child Care and Family Policies in Industrialized Countries

Overview

This section summarizes some of the main issues concerning the availability and quality of child care services and related policies in industrialized countries. It describes the policy choices that have been made regarding child care for young children, and presents different child care policy ‘models’ as they have emerged in various countries, illustrating alternative policy strategies and approaches to delivering child care (35).

Child care policies and programmes in high-income countries have evolved out of diverse historical streams, including child protection, early child- hood education, services for children with special needs, and services to facilitate mothers’ participation in the labour force. The current public debate revolves around several issues. For some people concerned with the well-being of children, the central aspect of child care is what it does for children. Others raise questions about the role of child care in increasing or decreasing female labour force participation rates, in socializing children into the society’s values, and in raising a more productive citizenry. In a number of countries, there is interest in the impact of different types of child care arrangements on such diverse domains as child development, school performance, fertility, marriage, female labour force participation and public expenditures. Increasingly, quality child care is viewed as a strategy for ensuring that women will be willing to have children at a time of sharply falling fertility rates.

The changing roles of women at home and the substantial growth in female labour force participation rates have clearly had an impact on the supply of child care services in different countries (see Table 2). However, while the countries with the most generous child care policies and the most extensive child care coverage tend to have high rates of female labour force participation, several countries have comparable policies and equally high or higher rates of coverage, yet have lower proportions of women in the work force. These policies can be fully understood only in the context of the array of family and social policies in place in those countries, including the cash benefits that support parenting, health insurance coverage, and so forth.

For whatever reasons and through whatever types of policies, it is clear that child care is increasingly viewed as a public responsibility in most industrialized countries, as well as an important entitlement for children.

Policies and Strategies

Care for children aged 3 to compulsory school entry

Universal preschool for children for one to three years before compulsory schooling begins has clearly emerged as the policy choice of most industrialized countries. Such preschool programmes are viewed as ‘good’ for all children — for purposes of child development as well as preparing them for primary school — regardless of mothers’ or parents’ labour force status, family income, cultural background, or capacity as parents. Almost all children within the age group participate in these programmes on a voluntary basis.

The preschool model that dominates continental Europe includes kindergartens, prekindergartens and nursery schools. It operates largely under educational auspices as part of the public education system or is publicly subsidized in the private non-profit sector. These programmes are free or charge modest income-related fees, and cover much of the normal school day and year, with more or less rich and developmentally appropriate curricula. Children participate to the extent that places are available. The coverage or enrolment pattern in most countries with a preschool programme is fairly similar: full coverage for 4- and 5-year-olds, and nearly that for the 2½- and 3-year-olds. As coverage expands, the most dramatic differences across countries concern variations in quality.

Throughout Europe these preschool programmes are thought of as an essential component of child and family policy generally and of child care policy in particular. A recent study prepared for the European Economic Community concluded that there is an almost universal parental demand for preschool, and that wherever programmes are available children attend (36). Although there is a lively policy
TABLE 2

Labour Force Participation Rates of Married and Single Women
With Children Under 18, and Child Care Coverage Rates for Children
of Different Ages, Selected Countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>% of mothers in the labour force</th>
<th>% of children in child care full and part-time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Single</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Britain</td>
<td>1988</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>1988</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>1988</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Germany</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>1988</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>1988</td>
<td>89 (c)</td>
<td>89 (d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td>1990</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Data assembled from varied sources. Child care data are largely from the mid-1980s.
(a) These data are for children aged 3-4 since compulsory school begins at age 3.
(b) These data are for children whose mothers work or are at school at least 20 hours per week.
(c) Data for Sweden are for women with children under 16.
(d) These data are for all children aged 1-6, from the time the parent leave ends until compulsory school begins, at age 7. The data include part-time programme as well as full-time. The rate for full-day coverage is 55%.
(e) Estimate for 1990-1995 largely part-time programme.

debate in several countries (especially in eastern Europe at the moment), the European child care policy goal is to establish preschool as a legal right or "eligibility," and make it accessible and available as primary school. Several countries have already achieved this goal and many others are rapidly approaching it.

Child care for children aged 0-3

Care for children under age 3 is the main child care focus for the 1990s. Increasingly, it involves some combination of maternity, parenting or child-rearing leave policies as well as child care services. Almost all the industrialized countries provide maternity or parenting leave to permit working women to recover from childbirth, and to enable the family to adapt to a new baby. Some countries provide more extensive paid and job-protected leave as a form of infant care or toddler care. These national leave policies vary in duration, in proportion of wages replaced, in their applicability to fathers as well as mothers, and in whether any part of the leave is mandatory for mothers. No high-income industrialized country, except for the United States and South Africa, is without such a national policy. The policy diversity that exists has led to varying rates of child care with care of 1- and 2-year-olds, not with the care of infants. For "toddler" care, some countries give more emphasis to child care services, while others stress cash benefits to permit at-home parental care, and some offer a range of options.

Infant care: Maternity and/or parenting leave

The first component of an infant/toddler care policy package addresses the needs of infants and their employed parents at the time the child is born and immediately thereafter (37) (38). Maternity and/or parenting policies for working parents include paid, job-protected leave. These policies are designed to ensure babies a good start in life and to protect maternal health while maintaining family income. More than 100 countries around the world have such
Leave policies, including all of Europe, Canada, Israel, Japan and many developing countries. At least two to three months of paid maternal/parental care is assured an infant, and often as much as five to six months in some of the European countries. As has been noted, the availability of maternity and parental policies is not just a function of high labour force participation rates for women. Among those countries with high rates only the United States does not have such national statutory policies, but many countries with far lower rates have enacted such laws.

One result of these leave policies is that out-of-home care for children under age 1 is not an issue in many European countries where labour force participation rates for women with young children are high. Very few children under age 1 are in care. Since virtually all working women who give birth are covered by such policies, children are at home for a good part of their first year, cared for by at least one parent. Several countries are also facilitating child care leave for fathers. The point at which a maternity or parenting leave ends has immediate consequences for when child care services are seen as essential.

Although specific programmes may vary from country to country, job-protected leave is always part of the employment policy, while cash benefits provided to offset the lost wage are always considered part of the social insurance or social security system. The benefit generally ranges from 60 to 100 per cent of the mother’s (or sometimes the father’s) insured wage (the maximum wage covered under social insurance). All the benefits are financed as either contributory or non-contributory social insurance benefits. In several countries, the employer and the government jointly bear the bulk of the burden, or the total cost, while in others, such as in Canada, the employee also contributes. A country’s health insurance system is most likely to carry administrative responsibility for maternity benefits. Israel, however, views this as an independent social insurance benefit; Britain mandates payments by the employer but provides reimbursement; and Canada and Austria deliver the benefit through the employment insurance system. The particular system employed is as much a product of the governmental structure of a country as it is of earlier history and ideology.

**Toddler care: Parenting and child-rearing benefits and services**

A critical issue in much of Europe is child care for children from about age 1 to 3. Until recently, expanding the supply of services was the most important child care policy for this age group. About one third of the women in Britain and Germany surveyed early in the 1980s indicated that they had not returned to work following the end of their post-childbirth leave because of the unavailability of child care. In some countries where the demand for female labour increased in the 1980s, the pressure to expand the supply of child care services for children under age 3 increased as well.

Currently, the policy picture is in flux in much of Europe as countries experiment with different patterns. These approaches include extending paid and job-protected leaves until children are 1, 2, or 3 years old, providing cash benefits that support those parents who choose to care for their very young children at home; targeting policies on low-income parents or employed parents; and expanding the supply of child care services for the children of working parents. Some countries have chosen a specific policy; others have selected a more diversified policy ‘menu’ of options (39). The countries that have established extended parental or child-rearing leave appear to have been motivated by some combination of factors, including low-birth rates, labour market shortages, high costs of infant and toddler care, child development concerns, and others.

Several countries, including Austria, Germany, Czechoslovakia, Hungary and France, are now either extending job-protected paid leave or offering child-related cash benefits designed to make it possible for some mothers of very young children to remain at home for longer periods than covered by the paid parenting/infant care leaves.

With regard to toddler services, the picture is highly diversified, in contrast to the preschool programmes described earlier. Family day care homes and group day care centres (crèches) both exist but there are not enough of either. In Denmark and Sweden, public subsidies are provided to permit three or four families to share the costs of a caregiver, who provides
care in the home of one of the families (or rotates among the homes). In France and Finland, a subsidy is also available to help pay for in-home care. In contrast to the maternity/parenting benefits (where coverage is already universal in Europe) and the preschool programmes (where coverage is universal in some countries and approaching that goal in others), provision of child care services for children aged 1-2 is limited, and coverage varies widely across countries.

In the countries where preschool programmes are part of the education system, programmes serving children under 3 are often under the jurisdiction of the ministries of health. Regardless of the programme type, these services for very young children are designed primarily to provide care for the children of working parents. Priority for acceptance, however, may also be given to children from single-parent families, children in low-income families, children in need of protective and compensatory programmes and immigrant children.

The infant/toddler group programmes do not have consistent or uniform curricula, and the family day care programmes have even less (34). Programmes usually operate 10-12 hours per day, and are often open from 6:30 a.m. to 6:30 p.m. Children usually attend for the full day. In some countries, such as Denmark and Sweden, where mothers are likely to work part-time, children may be in care for only part of the day. In southern Europe, these programmes usually close for about one month during the summer, but elsewhere they are open all year. Although age of entry is often closely linked to the length of the maternity/paternity leave, new places are often available only in September when the older children leave the programme to enter preschool. A shortage of programmes exists everywhere; no country claims to have an adequate supply of services for this age group (34).

The dominant programme mode for this age group is family day care, often because the supply of places in group facilities is so limited, rather than because parents prefer this type of care. In contrast to the United States, much of the family day care in countries such as Denmark, Finland, France, Germany and Sweden is under public sponsorship, with providers often being recruited, trained, supervised, and even paid by municipal child care administrators or local social agency administrators and staff.

There is, however, a growing trend in Europe to extend parenting leave in some form so as to make it possible for one parent to remain at home until a child is 1, 2, or 3. The rationales offered for these policies include the extraordinarily high costs of satisfactory out-of-home infant care, a belief that young children are better off if the mother stays home for a period of time, a desire to encourage low-skilled women to stay out of the labour force in a period of high unemployment, and an intent in facilitating a better balance between paid work and family work, especially for women.

A Note on Eastern Europe

There was neither time during the Seminar nor is there space in this Report for a satisfactory treatment of the implications of the extraordinary changes taking place in central and eastern Europe, including the former Soviet Union, for working parents, especially women, and for child care services. A few comments, however, may be in order, especially considering that the movement away from socialist models of development and towards the 'market economy' is also a trend, in varying degrees, in many developing countries — although starting from very different levels of industrialization, income and social infrastructure in most cases.

One of the main social issues the former socialist countries are facing is, in fact, the subject of "women, work and child care" (see Box on next page). This topic has acquired strong ideological and political overtones during the reform process. One of the reasons for this relates to the very high levels of female employment in most countries of central and eastern Europe and to the apparently disproportionate percentage of women now among the newly unemployed in parts of the region. This phenomenon might not be viewed so negatively (as it certainly is by many women in the region) were there evidence that the women leaving the labour force were, in some sense, returning 'voluntarily' to their household and child-rearing responsibilities. It is far from clear, however, that a desired movement of this sort is taking place (see Box on next page). Furthermore,
during the current period of severe pressures on real incomes, resulting from high inflation, reductions in social services and unemployment, most women workers have little choice but to continue to seek ways to supplement their families’ incomes.

A closely related issue in this region concerns child care policies and services. Family or child allowances have been an important cash benefit in most countries of central and eastern Europe. In what was probably the most generous system, family allowances in Czechoslovakia, assuming two children, accounted for about a quarter of the average child care services for working parents. Maternity leave policies have also been as or more generous than in many western countries. But, particularly during the decline in the economies of these countries since the early 1990s, only a small portion of women have been able to remain outside the labour force for more than brief periods following childbirth.

The availability of quality child care facilities has also been much more limited than has often been assumed. As in the western countries, coverage is more complete for the 3- to 6-year-old children than for the under 3s. Again Czechoslovakia has the high-

Unequal Burdens

...Despite their high participation in the labour force, women in Eastern Europe have remained responsible for the overwhelming majority of child care and household work. For example, in Hungary, surveys have shown that women are responsible for 75 percent of domestic labour.

This unequal distribution of household obligations between the sexes inevitably has spillover effects on the labour market. It is argued that women are less able to take employment far from their homes, to do overtime or to undertake further training, because of housework and childcare. They are perceived as unstable employees, who are compelled to take more time off work, to care for children, and increasingly, elderly parents. Because of the policies of maternity leave, young women are perceived as “imminent mothers” who are bound to be absent from the work place for many years while government regulations require the employer to hold the original job open.

With a triple work burden, limited opportunities for promotion or higher income, and decreasing job satisfaction, such an attitude on the part of employers may well have been correct in the years preceding the reform. In a rapidly changing economy, increased unemployment, lower incomes, higher prices and increased labour mobility by one or both spouses, neither an assured income, nor the traditional family model of the two-parent household may continue to apply. A decline in the participation of women in the labour market may be seen as an opportunity for women to be full-time mothers. However, unless or until the previous attitudes on women’s employment change they can have a tangible effect on the demand for female labour (41).

wage in the manufacturing sector — compared with roughly 13 per cent as an average for the OECD countries (40). With wages in the region relatively low, however, these allowances generally became seen as essential for a minimum wage level, rather than as a means to facilitate the provision of quality

est coverage of children in this age group (96 per cent); rates close to or exceeding 80 per cent can be found in Hungary, Bulgaria and Romania. In other countries, however, the rates are closer to one half and apparently as low as 20 per cent in Yugoslavia. (All figures are for the 1986-89 period). With the excep-
tion of the former German Democratic Republic, coverage for the 0-3 age group, however, is only about 20 per cent in the highest cases (Czechoslovakia and Hungary) and much less elsewhere.

Although the often dreadful conditions in the residential care institutions, most prominently in Romania, have received most attention (42), recently reported research is suggesting considerable problems of quality in many of the day care establishments as well. Even in the relatively favourable conditions prevailing in Czechoslovakia, a leading researcher has reported that the “development of pre-school daycare facilities, especially nurseries, has been determined primarily by economic needs of society, not by the needs of the children”. Studies in Czechoslovakia suggest that the morbidity rate among nursery school children is 60 per cent higher than for children cared for at home. Numerous stress conditions in nurseries and kindergartens have been identified: a lack of an individual approach to the child, few possibilities for spontaneous play, overcrowding and excessive noise and overly critical personnel, to mention a few. One pilot study reports that 23 per cent of the kindergarten children were found to have mild, and 9 per cent serious, emotional problems or disorders (43).

These brief comments (and the views reflected in the two Boxes) are not intended to imply that the problems of “women, work and child care” in central and eastern Europe are unique among industrialized countries. Problems of women torn between jobs and family and serious concerns regarding the availability, cost and quality of child care facilities are hardly unknown in the industrialized West. The exceptionally rapid economic, political and social changes taking place in the former socialist countries of eastern Europe, however, present a formidable challenge to policy makers concerned with family and child care issues. This unprecedented transition is surely worthy of careful attention and systematic monitoring, especially of the situation of vulnerable groups, including women heading households, pregnant women, infants and toddlers in low-income families, and women and children of ethnic minorities.

---

**Women Return to the Family**

Women’s return to the family is occurring in a context of the general retreat of the state from social (welfare) provision. Concretely, this means for women that once they become unemployed and therefore lose their right to a childcare place, finding a new job becomes objectively more difficult. Indeed there is a vicious circle whereby it is difficult to find a job without being readily available to start work, which a woman cannot achieve without a childcare place, to which she is not entitled unless she has a job.

Devolution of state responsibility for childcare provision onto individual enterprises struggling to survive in the marketplace means that in the attempt to cut costs they tend to shed workplaces nurseries and creches as “optional extras”. In the former GDR and in Hungary, enterprises have passed these facilities over to the local authorities, themselves virtually bankrupt and unable to take them on. As a result many childcare facilities have already been closed down and there are fears that this will become more widespread. With the simultaneous removal of the massive subsidies which meant that childcare was free with the exception of a tiny nominal fee for the hot meals children were given at midday, there is thus a dual process at work which results in childcare being both less available and priced out of reach. As early as 1990 there were reports in Poland of women “voluntarily” giving up their jobs once they could no longer afford the childcare fees, especially for more than one child (44).
V. CHILD CARE PROGRAMMES IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES: THE NEED FOR A RANGE OF OPTIONS

The Needs of the Young Child

It is widely accepted that the first years of a child’s life are of critical importance. The first two years are characterized by rapid growth and some of life’s most significant learning experiences including walking and talking, perceiving fear and pleasure, discovery of the self and others. Care services intended for children in this age group must protect their physical integrity and provide them with the diet needed for their growth. They must also promote their psychological, social and emotional development and intellectual curiosity in a climate of affection and security. During the first two years, in supportive physical, emotional and social environments, the development of critical brain structures continues to fuel behavioural changes that enhance children’s abilities to learn from and shape their interactions with caregivers and the environment.

The preschool period between the ages of 3 and 6 is also one of rapid physical and mental development. Children gain confidence in their bodies, strive for independence by doing things on their own, and experiment with the objects that surround them. They show a livelier curiosity at what is going on about them, enjoy the company of other children, and seek to imitate adult behaviour. They learn to assert themselves as individuals and begin to acquire self-control and a sense of discipline. During this period the child’s intellectual and social development proceeds apace, as illustrated by the acquisition of sophisticated language skills, and the adoption of culturally acceptable behaviour patterns. While the health needs of children in this age group still require constant attention, it is also essential to provide challenges that respond to their enormous thirst for learning and to prepare them for symbolic and logical thinking skills required in formal schooling. Such environments help to create children with a positive self concept who seek, establish and maintain the kinds of supportive relationships that continue to produce successful outcomes. The cycle of success can be as perpetuating as the cycle of failure. Adequate environments that are capable of responding and enhancing these basic universal needs are indeed the right of all children.

The scientific evidence accumulated during the past decade powerfully demonstrates the long-term benefits associated with increased investments in well-conceived and properly managed child development programmes. In the past, concerned professionals were forced to rely on data from the industrialized world to justify their investments in early child development activities. More recently, a growing body of data from the developing world indicates the long-term benefits of such investments to children and their families as reflected in increased primary school enrolments and enhanced school progress and performance. These data reinforce the assumption that not only are similarly positive effects of early interventions possible in the developing world, but also that the potential for bringing about improvements may be greatest when social and economic conditions are more severe.

Although the policy implications of these findings are of considerable importance, they have generally overlooked in planning interventions for young children. Some of the resistance to early child development programmes stems from misconceptions regarding the factors that optimize or constrain the child’s early development. Rather than attending to the interrelations between growth and development, sceptics of child development efforts regard change in a sequential fashion, with survival goals in first place followed by efforts to address the quality of that survival. Another source of resistance is the erroneous perception that the child in the first few years is a passive recipient rather than an active creator of his own knowledge. It is sometimes argued, moreover, that the coping strategies developed by families and communities to care for the needs of the young child are quite sufficient and should not be interfered with by forces external to the familial unit. In this perspective, learning begins upon entry into primary school and not, as the scientific evidence powerfully demonstrates, from the moment of birth through the active interaction of the infant with the people and things in his environment. Policy makers have also rejected proposals for child development programmes based on misleading assertions related to high costs, the need for sophisticated teaching methodologies and equipment, and fear of overburdening formal school systems with the responsibilities for formal preschool programmes.

Recognizing these barriers, seminar participants reviewed the availability and effectiveness of child care programmes and defined a typology of programming options. Through an analysis of case studies, the insights gained and challenges yet to be explored in increasing the availability and cost-effectiveness of community-based child development programmes that address the intersecting needs of women and their children were put forth.

Programme Availability

A complete picture of the coverage rates of various types of child care in developing countries is not currently available. Accurate and reliable statistics are difficult to obtain since most care by family members, as well as informal group care outside the home, is unregistered. Moreover, existing records of formal programmes mandated or organized by national and local governments are often outdated. In spite of the absence of accurate statistics on the extent and quality of child care in developing countries, it is generally accepted that, with the exception of a limited number of socialist countries, publicly supported and supervised programmes of child care that respond to women’s work needs are limited. For instance, only about one per cent of India’s 33 to 34 million preschool-aged children are formally enrolled in day care. Similarly, Peru is estimated to have regulated day care for less than one per cent of preschool aged children. The absence of child care programmes, linked to women’s work or not, is even more pronounced in many African countries.

These figures, however, do not include the wide range of informal early child development activities which have emerged since the International Year of the Child in 1979. Hundreds of small-scale demonstration projects and several large-scale initiatives underscoring the possibilities for early child development programmes are in operation. In fact, the expansion of child programmes over the last decade has been dramatic. Although few of these initiatives were undertaken explicitly to meet the needs of working women, it is clear that some of the demand comes from the increasing tendency for women to work outside the home, especially in cities and towns.

In Korea during 1982-1986, the percentage of children attending early child development programmes increased from 8 to 57 per cent. The expansion of government-supported, centre-based programmes stemmed in part from the increased need for child care services resulting from the entrance of women into the labour force. This expansion is also seen in Sri Lanka’s efforts to cover all 5-year-old children by extending the age of entry into primary school downward and transforming the first year of schooling into a kindergarten for all. Thailand now provides some form of preschool for approximately 24 per cent of all children between the ages of 3 and 6 through non-formal centre-based programmes combined with parental education activities. In the Philippines, 19 per cent of all children aged 3 to 6 participate in an early childhood enrichment programme which provides learning opportunities to disadvantaged preschool children in a structured centre-based setting. In China, the All China Women’s Federation has created over 200,000 local parent education programmes during the past four years. The curriculum emphasizes the interaction between the physical, nutritional and psychological dimensions of development. The programme, designed in collaboration with the community, is integrated into existing preschools, primary schools, or linked to periodical medical visits.

Complementary Strategies

The early development of the child is promoted by a continuous interactive process between the developing child and other people and objects in a constantly changing environment. That changing environment includes the immediate context of the family and the community as well as a larger social, political and economic context with attendant institutions, laws, policies and norms, as well as a culture providing values, rituals and beliefs. Recognition of the wide variation among these systems both between and within developing countries has led to the elaboration of five complementary programme approaches, including:

1. Delivering a service. The immediate goal of this direct approach is to enhance child development by attending to the immediate needs of children in centres organized outside the home. These are, in a sense, substitute or alternative environments to the home.
2. Educating caregivers. This approach is intended to educate and 'empower' parents and alternative caregivers in ways that improve their care and interaction with the child and enrich the immediate environment.

3. Promoting community development. This strategy stresses community initiative, organization and participation in a range of interrelated activities to improve the physical environment, the knowledge and practices of community members, and the organizational base, allowing common action and improving the base for political and social negotiations. Although not necessarily focussed on the needs of children, this approach has proven to be a useful strategy to which early child development initiatives can be linked.

4. Strengthening national resources and capacities. The institutions responsible for implementing programmes require financial, material and human resources with a capacity for the planning, organization and implementation of innovative techniques and models.

5. Advocating to increase demand. This programme approach concentrates on the production and distribution of knowledge in order to create awareness and demand. It may function at the level of policy makers and planners, or can be directed to the general public by changing the cultural environment that affects child development.

Although all five of these approaches are intended to enhance early child development, each has different immediate objectives and is directed towards a different audience or group of participants. The table on the next page summarizes the beneficiaries, objectives and illustrative models for each approach (1).

Any comprehensive plan for enhancing child development must pay attention to all five of the approaches set out in this table. The emphases given within the overall strategy will, of course, vary considerably, depending on the conditions of the setting in which the programme is being developed. In spite of various approaches, the main goal of early childhood education and development programmes is to enhance the competence of children to adjust to, perform in, and transform their own surroundings. In some cultures this means greater emphasis on independence; in others, greater emphasis on group solidarity. The ultimate outcome for all programmes, however, is to enhance the child's physical, intellectual and social development.

Three sets of considerations are helpful in overcoming the piecemeal approach that has unfortunately dominated policy in the past (45). The first has just been described: to seek to develop each of the complementary approaches outlined in Table 3. A second consideration includes a set of guidelines (46) indicating that programmes should be comprehensive (dealing with a full range of health and developmental needs), participatory and community-based; flexible and adjusted to different socio-cultural contexts; support and build upon local ways that have been devised to cope effectively with problems of child care and development; financially feasible and cost-effective; and should try to reach the largest possible number of children who are 'at risk'.

The third consideration relates to a programme's ability to target specific age groups with developmentally appropriate interventions. Thus, the tendency to restrict programming for child development to a particular age group and to emphasize the simultaneous character of survival, growth and development is counteracted by the need for programmes to cover the pre-natal period, and the early childhood period which extends from approximately age 3 to age 6 and includes the critical transition from home to school.

Innovative programming efforts incorporating the three dimensions suggested by this framework are numerous. UNICEF and collaborating international organizations, including the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), the World Health Organization (WHO), the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) and the World Bank, have contributed to this set of complementary strategies. In addition, private foundations including, for example, the Bernard van Leer Foundation, Save the Children Federation and the Aga Khan Foundation, have long supported the implementation of comprehensive early childhood development activities. These programmes seek to attract large numbers of children, with particular emphasis on children under 2 years of age.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Programme Approach</th>
<th>Participants/ Beneficiaries</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Models</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Deliver a service</td>
<td>The Child</td>
<td>Survival</td>
<td>Home day care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0-2 years</td>
<td>Comprehensive development</td>
<td>Integrated child development centres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3-6 years</td>
<td>Socialization</td>
<td>‘Add-on’ centres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0-6 years</td>
<td>Rehabilitation</td>
<td>Work-place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Improvement of child care</td>
<td>Preschools: formal/ non-formal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educate caregivers</td>
<td>Parent, family</td>
<td>Create awareness</td>
<td>Home visiting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sibling(s)</td>
<td>Change attitudes</td>
<td>Parental education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Public</td>
<td>Improve/change practices</td>
<td>Child-to-Child programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mass media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promote community development</td>
<td>Community</td>
<td>Create awareness</td>
<td>Technical mobilization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Leaders</td>
<td>Mobilize for action</td>
<td>Social mobilization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Promoters</td>
<td>Change conditions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Members</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthen national resources, capacities</td>
<td>Programme personnel</td>
<td>Create awareness</td>
<td>Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professionals</td>
<td>Improve skills</td>
<td>Experimental, demonstration projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Para-professionals</td>
<td>Increase material</td>
<td>Strengthening infrastructure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advocate to increase demand</td>
<td>Policy makers</td>
<td>Create awareness</td>
<td>Social marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Public</td>
<td>Build political will</td>
<td>Ethos creation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professionals</td>
<td>Increase demand</td>
<td>Knowledge dissemination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Change attitudes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Case Studies: Women, Work and Child Care

Unfortunately, most of these early child programmes have only indirectly responded to the child care needs of working mothers. Many programmes operate for three or four hours a day during the week. The overall goal of the majority of these programmes is to develop a child’s learning skills or to address nutritional or health issues. The preschool bias favours attention beginning at age 3 or 4, leaving the needs of working mothers with younger children largely unaddressed. In addition, the quality of the programmes is often so poor that positive benefits to the child are minimal, and in some instances negative outcomes may be apparent. The failure of such programmes to combine their child-centred approach with the needs of working women is discouraging given the current increase and expansion of these programmes.

Child programmes tailored specifically to meet the needs of working women have identified several potentially effective strategies. For example, India’s mobile créches, located at construction sites, are small-scale day care facilities that provide services to female construction workers with small children. The classic factory day care facility, propagated by the International Labour Organisation in the early decades of this century, was also designed to serve a specific sector of working women. However, the success of these initiatives has been limited at best, as employers often chose to replace women workers with men rather than assume the costs of day care. Moreover, the absence of programmes has been blamed on problems of transporting children to work places, variation in working hours, and the dangerous environments characterizing many work settings. A third type of programme, such as the one operating in Senegal (47), involves rural agricultural workers. In this project mothers, on a rotational basis, provide care to groups of children. Cooperatives of women rice-planters operate day care facilities during seasons of peak demand.

Seminar participants examined in more detail UNICEF’s initiatives in Nepal, Ecuador and Ethiopia that have attempted to address simultaneously the multiple needs of working women in providing quality care for their children. The programme in Nepal entails the development of a home-based child care programme as a component of a production credit scheme for rural women, and is based on mothers who look after small groups of young children on a rotational basis. For poor women living in the squatter settlements of Guayaquil, one of Ecuador’s major cities, child care services were developed as part of the UNICEF-sponsored Basic Urban Services Project. The project includes home-based as well as centre-based models of child care, which are already in operation. The day care services provided to the children of mothers working in two agricultural productive cooperatives are described in the case study from Ethiopia. Seminar participants’ examination of UNICEF-supported activities in other countries, including China, Korea, Venezuela, Peru and Morocco, underscored the variations in women’s work and child care responsibilities resulting from the complex interplay of political, social, cultural, religious and economic forces. Some of these case studies are presented in this Report (see page 35).

Programme Challenges

As illustrated by these case studies, several factors characterize successful programming initiatives. Of primary importance is a strong political commitment that enables the identification of the resources needed to achieve a set of clearly specified programme goals and objectives. Political support is also critical to ensure stability, commitment, and continuity of programme leadership. Additional characteristics of these programmes include the application of media channels to create demand for services, the development of simple and efficient information systems to monitor progress and measure performance, and the implementation of flexible interactive training approaches that combine short-term instruction with ongoing field-level supervision and follow-up.

Programming success in early child development activities is consistently characterized by a well-defined set of variables that recognizes the simultaneous nature of survival and development and the interaction among the child’s physical, mental, social and emotional capabilities. Another characteristic defining success is the emphasis placed on empowering mothers (and, unfortunately only rarely, fathers) and communities with the knowledge and
skills needed to provide for the health, nutrition and developmental needs of their children. Sustainable programmes are able to identify local patterns and practices of child-rearing which have for generations provided culturally appropriate solutions. Once identified, this knowledge is used to inform the design of locally appropriate programmes, integrating when appropriate, new information and the creation of innovative solutions. Successful programmes encourage a level of participation beyond the formal definitions of community participation and include the child as an active participant in the creation of her or his own knowledge. Moreover, early learning is not dependent on the utilization of expensive equipment and learning tools, but can be developed through the application of low-cost materials combined with a caregiver familiar with a creative training curriculum and motivated by an ongoing system of rewards and incentives.

In contrast to the 3-6 year-old age group, the current set of strategies is less successful in reaching high-risk mothers and infants during the prenatal period and the first two years of life with integrated programmes that provide the appropriate balance of health, nutrition and psycho-social components. The vertical thinking and sectoral competition characterizing government bureaucracies and international donors as well as child care providers often conflict with this need to provide a comprehensive set of services. Programmes also must make much greater efforts to involve fathers' participation in child care, recognizing that parenting is a shared responsibility. The failure to do so threatens the viability and effectiveness of the family, the most fundamental of all social institutions.

The challenges to meeting the child care needs of working mothers are set before us. These challenges require solutions that demand long-term commitment by professionals across many disciplines to address issues related to actual rather than theoretical integration and convergence of services. How and when to involve government and employers in the complex process of expansion and how to define the critical components of programme quality are pressing concerns. Without commitment to the infrastructure needed to supplement intensive training courses with ongoing supervision and follow-up, the kinds of programmes we consider essential will remain an ideal. Experience suggests that monitoring and information management systems are of particular importance to enable programmes to adjust to constantly changing circumstances. Finally, we must continue to allow for the systematic interaction among families, children and communities. Programmes should not only incorporate and build upon parental wisdom but must begin to identify the culture-specific opportunities for partnerships with mothers and fathers that are open to us, for a brief amount of time, during the child's passage through infancy and early childhood.
NEPAL: THE HOME-BASED ‘ENTRY POINT’ PROGRAMME

Nepal is wedged between India and China; the land descends from the peaks of the Himalayas, through the hills, to the sub-tropical plains known as terai. Ninety-four per cent of Nepal’s population lives in rural areas; around half in villages inaccessible by road. The country’s great geographical variety is matched by the diversity of ethnic groups and cultural practices.

The population of Nepal is close to 18 million, including eight million children under the age of fifteen. Large families, averaging six children or more, are the norm. The significance and resilience of the family constitutes a point of cultural convergence across the various ethnic groups. In all cases, however, pressure is now being felt by these large extended families as land holdings, which have been divided and redivided for generations, become too small to support so many people.

Throughout Nepal the vast majority of the population are subsistence farmers. The family farm produces 80 per cent of the average annual household income. In the division of labour, the major workload falls upon women, and it is assumed that she will fulfill multiple roles. According to some studies, a Nepalese woman may spend almost eleven hours a day to maintain the family’s subsistence level. Men, by comparison, are involved in the work of the family’s farm for approximately six hours daily. However, the time rural women in Nepal can spend on activities with potentially higher economic return is limited by their extremely heavy burden of providing food, water and fuel for their family, and in caring for their children. As mothers, women play a critical role in their children’s development, but they are often limited in their ability to nurture and stimulate them adequately because of their difficult social and economic conditions. They simply have very little time to spend with their children.

In Nepal, almost 40 per cent of children drop out of school during the first year. Access of girls and women to educational opportunities is particularly limited, and today 82 per cent of Nepalese women are illiterate. From an early age, girls are expected to participate in household labour, particularly in child care, thus reducing the likelihood that they attend school. Combined with a great lack of confidence in the education system, this has meant that only 30 per cent of school-age girls are currently enrolled at primary school; in some districts, enrolment of girls is as low as 13 per cent and their attendance is about 50 per cent lower than boys.

The challenge, therefore, is to develop effective programmes which simultaneously address women’s and children’s intersecting needs. It must be taken into account that the demands accompanying women’s multiple roles as mothers, workers and housekeepers can become overwhelming.

In this sense, the UNICEF-supported Production Credit for Rural Women (PCRW) project provides support for a range of linked credit and community development activities carried out by village women. This project assists low-income rural women to take advantage of credit schemes through national banking institutions for agricultural production, cottage industries and services. In the original design, child care arrangements were envisaged as one small component of the PCRW’s community development approach. The main concern was to free up women’s time so that they would be better able to engage in income-generation activities. But more and more frequently, field workers identified child care as a priority.
Referring to it in Nepali as ‘praveshdwar’, which means first door into an important place, the entry point programme is by far the most innovative component of the PCRW activities. The programme concentrates on the woman’s role within the family both as mother and worker. A second component of the programme includes general themes on child development and care. Recognition of the interactive effect between health, nutrition and stimulation is implicit in the design of the curriculum and this integrated approach is evident throughout all the aspects of the programme.

Mothers who want to participate form a group (usually six women) that becomes the focal point for action. Sometimes, the community arranges a site for the programme, which includes a latrine and a kitchen. More often, however, the mothers run the programme in their own homes on a rotational basis. The groups meet weekly to ensure that the programme is running smoothly and to establish a schedule according to their own needs.

Training activities take place on-site. While mothers attend the training sessions, fathers are shown how to make the toys which will be used in the programme. They are provided with a basic kit of materials containing cooking utensils, plates, cups, a bucket, a jug, personal hygiene products, a rug, two dolls, three puppets, a ball and a drum. Besides this basic kit, nine different kits are in use now. Neighbouring groups exchange materials periodically so that children can be exposed to a wide variety of toys and play materials. As almost all the mothers are illiterate, a pictorial chart is used to indicate the daily schedule of activities. Children engage in individual activities that teach them a variety of different skills and concepts while at play. Strong emphasis is placed on personal hygiene and use of the latrine.

Most importantly, the training emphasizes the importance of mothers as caregivers and teachers, and aims at building up women’s confidence in their ability to manage and run the programme regularly. The quality of the mother-child interaction changes due to increased knowledge and confidence between them. However, the benefits of the programme are not limited to participating children. Women and mothers learn basic individual and group management skills by working cooperatively over an extended period of time. Thus, the skills and confidence they gain are carried over into other community development and income-generation activities.

Recognition of the crucial importance of the group dynamics of the programme is a key element of the PCRW project. The identification of common objectives (such as obtaining credit for the family farm) that led to the formation of groups helped build women’s confidence in their own ability to improve their conditions. At the same time, the mutual support that women provide to each other has many implications for improving their children’s well-being.

**ECUADOR: COMMUNITY-BASED CHILD CARE PROGRAMMES IN AN URBAN SETTING**

Located on the shores of the Guayas river, on the Pacific coast, the city of Guayaquil is the second largest city and most important port in Ecuador. The oil boom in the early seventies, among other factors, brought about the rapid expansion of modern industry and increased public expenditures in urban areas. Large-scale rural migration flows into Guayaquil resulted in the growth of slums and squatter settlements. Known
locally as 'suburbios', these areas are characterized by extreme poverty, scarce employment and job opportunities, low-standard housing and inadequate access to health and social services.

More than 16 per cent of all households in the 'suburbios' are headed by women. In recent years, women living in these settlements have been forced to make significant contributions to the family income, working both at home and outside, as the cost of living continues to rise.

Children living in these settlements suffer from poor health, inadequate hygiene and sanitation, and malnutrition. As existing child care facilities were few or inaccessible to the majority of the population living in the marginal areas of Guayaquil, UNICEF, in collaboration with the government of Ecuador, incorporated day care services as part of the Basic Services Project. The project includes four basic components: preschool child care, primary health care, social communication and recreation, and women's promotion and organization. The four programmes seek to improve the living conditions of the inhabitants of selected marginal sectors of Guayaquil through the provision of services that incorporate the participation of the entire community.

These programmes are of particular interest because they attempt to address problems affecting residents of marginal urban areas through a variety of interrelated activities. For example, the need of women in the 'suburbios' to earn income is addressed directly through the Women's Promotion and Organization Programme, which focuses on the promotion of income-generating activities, and less directly through the Preschool Child Care Programme, which not only provides a source of good quality, reliable child care, but also provides employment as caregivers to two groups of women: home-care mothers and high school and college promoters.

Two models of child care programmes have been established as an integral part of the Basic Urban Services project. First, the Community Home for Children (HCH) model provides care for children of working mothers within the community. The service, in this case, is provided in the home of a female neighbour who has been trained to work as a full-time caregiver. She is helped by an assistant also trained by the programme. Generally, fifteen children from 6 months to 6 years of age stay at the HCHs between eight and nine hours daily, five days a week. Second, the Community Centre for Children (CCP) model offers care for a maximum of 100 children at a site provided by the community. Children from 3 to 6 years of age attend these centres from three to four hours a day, during either the morning or the afternoon session, five days a week.

Caregivers, mother-caregivers and community promoters, participating in both programmes are selected by the community. In the case of the mother-caregivers, they must have had some previous experience in raising children, their houses must be adequate to hold additional children, and they must know how to read and write. In the case of the community promoters, they must be secondary school or college students and reside within the community. Supervisors are university-level professionals with experience in child care programmes.

In addition, the Women's Promotion Programme seeks to assist women in improving their lives through provision of information, consciousness raising, training, expansion of productive roles, and relief of domestic burdens. It encourages women to identify common interests and concerns, organize, and work together within the community. One of the main activities of the programme is the Basic Staples Marketing
Referred to in Nepali as 'praveshdwar', which means first door into an important place, the entry point programme is by far the most innovative component of the PCRW activities. The programme concentrates on the woman's role within the family, both as mother and worker. A second component of the programme includes general themes on child development and care. Recognition of the interactive effect between health, nutrition and stimulation is implicit in the design of the curriculum and this integrated approach is evident throughout all the aspects of the programme.

Mothers who want to participate form a group (usually six women) that becomes the focal point for action. Sometimes, the community arranges a site for the programme, which includes a latrine and a kitchen. More often, however, the mothers run the programme in their own homes on a rotational basis. The groups meet weekly to ensure that the programme is running smoothly and to establish a schedule according to their own needs.

Training activities take place on-site. While mothers attend the training sessions, fathers are shown how to make the toys which will be used in the programme. They are provided with a basic kit of materials containing cooking utensils, plates, cups, a bucket, a jug, personal hygiene products, a rug, two dolls, three puppets, a ball and a drum. Besides this basic kit, nine different kits are in use now. Neighbouring groups exchange materials periodically so that children can be exposed to a wide variety of toys and play materials. As almost all the mothers are illiterate, a pictorial chart is used to indicate the daily schedule of activities. Children engage in individual activities that teach them a variety of different skills and concepts while at play. Strong emphasis is placed on personal hygiene and use of the latrine.

Most importantly, the training emphasizes the importance of mothers as caregivers and teachers, and aims at building up women's confidence in their ability to manage and run the programme regularly. The quality of the mother-child interaction changes due to increased knowledge and confidence between them. However, the benefits of the programme are not limited to participating children. Women and mothers learn basic individual and group management skills by working cooperatively over an extended period of time. Thus, the skills and confidence they gain are carried over into other community development and income generation activities.

Recognition of the crucial importance of the group dynamics of the programme is a key element of the PCRW project. The identification of common objectives (such as obtaining credit for the family farm) that led to the formation of groups helped build women's confidence in their own ability to improve their conditions. At the same time, the mutual support that women provide to each other has many implications for improving their children's well-being.

**ECUADOR:**

**COMMUNITY-BASED CHILD CARE PROGRAMMES IN AN URBAN SETTING**

Located on the shores of the Guayas river, on the Pacific coast, the city of Guayaquil is the second largest city and most important port in Ecuador. The oil boom in the early seventies, among other factors, brought about the rapid expansion of modern industry and increased public expenditures in urban areas. Large-scale rural migration flows into Guayaquil resulted in the growth of slums and squatter settlements. Known
locally as ‘suburbios’, these areas are characterized by extreme poverty, scarce employment and job opportunities, low-standard housing and inadequate access to health and social services.

More than 16 per cent of all households in the ‘suburbios’ are headed by women. In recent years, women living in these settlements have been forced to make significant contributions to the family income, working both at home and outside, as the cost of living continues to rise.

Children living in these settlements suffer from poor health, inadequate hygiene and sanitation, and malnutrition. As existing child care facilities were few or inaccessible to the majority of the population living in the marginal areas of Guayaquil, UNICEF, in collaboration with the government of Ecuador, incorporated day care services as part of the Basic Services Project. The project includes four basic components: preschool child care, primary health care, social communication and recreation, and women’s promotion and organization. The four programmes seek to improve the living conditions of the inhabitants of selected marginal sectors of Guayaquil through the provision of services that incorporate the participation of the entire community.

These programmes are of particular interest because they attempt to address problems affecting residents of marginal urban areas through a variety of interrelated activities. For example, the need of women in the ‘suburbios’ to earn income is addressed directly through the Women’s Promotion and Organization Programme, which focuses on the promotion of income-generating activities, and less directly through the Preschool Child Care Programme, which not only provides a source of good quality, reliable child care, but also provides employment as caregivers to two groups of women: home-care mothers and high school and college promoters.

Two models of child care programmes have been established as an integral part of the Basic Urban Services project. First, the Community Home for Children (HCI) model provides care for children of working mothers within the community. The service, in this case, is provided in the home of a female neighbour who has been trained to work as a full-time caregiver. She is helped by an assistant also trained by the programme. Generally, fifteen children from 6 months to 6 years of age stay at the HCIs between eight and nine hours daily, five days a week. Second, the Community Centre for Children (CCI) model offers care for a maximum of 100 children at a site provided by the community. Children from 3 to 6 years of age attend these centres from three to four hours a day, during either the morning or the afternoon session, five days a week.

Caregivers, mother-caregivers and community promoters, participating in both programmes are selected by the community. In the case of the mother-caregivers, they must have had some previous experience in raising children, their houses must be adequate to hold additional children, and they must know how to read and write. In the case of the community promoters, they must be secondary school or college students and reside within the community. Supervisors are university-level professionals with experience in child care programmes.

In addition, the Women’s Promotion Programme seeks to assist women in improving their lives through provision of information, consciousness raising, training, expansion of productive roles, and relief of domestic burdens. It encourages women to identify common interests and concerns, organize, and work together within the community. One of the main activities of the programme is the Basic Staples Marketing
Network formed by 'honest' storekeepers, selected by the community, who commit themselves to sell basic staples (such as rice, sugar and milk) at fair prices in exchange for access to training and credit programmes at the National Institute of Children and Families (INNAF). In cooperation with some commercial banks, the women's programme has also managed to establish a loan programme for small entrepreneurs and to offer training in non-traditional sectors for women, such as auto-mechanics and appliances-repair work. Women participating in one of these neighbourhood programmes may also be working, as a mother-caregiver or may have worked as a health community promoter.

Educating the mothers who bring their children to the homes and centres is one of the most important activities of the project. Mothers and daughters are included in every training activity; fathers and brothers are always invited to attend as well, but unfortunately their involvement is limited. Some of the obstacles the programmes are faced with are worth mentioning. On the one hand, the disparities in the mother's educational level is apparent. On the other hand, many of the participating women put in long working days, which does not allow them very much time to attend these meetings. The lack of available time is even more serious a problem for mothers who are heads of the household and carry multiple responsibilities on their shoulders. Therefore, parent education is achieved basically in two ways: during the daily interaction that occurs when mothers drop off and pick up their children, and through meetings with the parents' committee in the Community Home every two weeks.

In sum, both modes of preschool child care described above attempt to meet evident needs of the community. In the case of HCSs, for example, mothers can go out to work or look for work outside the home with the assurance that their children are being adequately cared for, fed and kept safely away from physical danger. In the case of CCs, children have the opportunity to develop their intellectual, emotional, physical and social potential.

These centres have had considerable impact on children's health and nutritional status and their psycho-social development. Obviously, care, regular feeding, disease prevention and control of diarrhoea have all contributed to improving the children's nutritional status. The testimonies of mothers and caregivers indicate that many children attending the programmes have recovered from severe malnutrition. Although it is more complex to measure the impact of the programme on children's psychological and emotional development, improvement in their general socialization abilities is apparent. Children became less shy towards visitors and strangers and better able to share, work or play in groups.

For working mothers, the greatest benefit of the child care programme is the satisfaction and peace of mind that a mother feels when she leaves her child with someone who genuinely cares for him or her.

ETHIOPIA: PROVIDING CHILD CARE WITHIN FARMERS' COOPERATIVES

The Melka Obia Farmers' Producers' Cooperative is located about 120 kms. south-east of Addis Ababa, Ethiopia's capital city. Accessible by road all year round, the cooperative is situated on a plain flanked by hills, dissected by the Awash river flowing...
west to east. The region is hot and dry with very limited rainfall, making farming activities unreliable for subsistence. Except for fruit trees and a few shrubs, the land is completely deforested. As part of Ethiopia's land reform policy, the government resettled 192 farmers and their families in Melka Oba. They organized themselves as a producers' cooperative and began growing fruits and vegetables for the local market. Cooperative members are divided into six working teams to carry out farming activities: two teams in the orchard, two teams in cereal production, one team in growing vegetables and two teams who serve as sentinels against thieves and wild animals.

An assessment of the situation in Melka Oba prior to the start of the day care programme revealed that the women were overworked in comparison to the men. Their tasks on the farm and the housework left women little time for relaxation. No health services were available and children lacked proper care. The community did not have a clean and safe water supply or environmental sanitation. Consequently, most children suffered from common health problems, such as diarrhoea, gastrointestinal infections, conjunctivitis, malaria, and ear and respiratory infections. Infant mortality rates were reported to be unusually high.

As women received only 45 days leave after delivery, mothers went quickly back to work in the fields for the entire day. This practice resulted in a dramatic decrease in breastfeeding. Also, children were often neglected after their mothers resumed work in the fields. In the absence of mothers and fathers, young children were, in most cases, left to fend for themselves, or older siblings were charged with the responsibility of caring for younger children and infants. While an elementary school was located about six kilometres away, the absence of a day care centre had forced the community to turn their own elders into babysitters instead of sending them to school.

In sum, the absence of proper child care, clinic services, pit latrines and refuse latrines, clean and potable water all contributed to putting children and women in a hazardous situation. In accordance with the community's traditions and norms, child care was considered as a woman's responsibility — another task that women were supposed to carry out in addition to other domestic chores and the duties on the farm.

In 1982 the cooperative requested assistance from the district administrators to establish a day care centre. The situation of women and children in Melka Oba was brought to the attention of the Integrated Family Life Education Project (IFLE), a semi-autonomous agency supervised by the Ethiopian Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, and mainly financed by UNICEF. The establishment of a creche and a kindergarten were considered urgent needs in Melka Oba. Also, they would serve as entry points for later initiatives in child survival and the promotion of various social services.

The goals of the project were to develop a programme that would: (1) ensure the safety and proper care of children while mothers are away at work; (2) allow mothers time off for breastfeeding; (3) provide regular immunization services; (4) develop a programme that would monitor the normal growth and development of children; (5) provide broad-based family education programmes to both men and women in the areas of health, child care, nutrition, family planning and environmental sanitation; (6) alleviate some of the burdens women face in providing water, fuel, food processing and cooking; (7) ease farmers' workload through the provision of basic technology; and (8) train traditional birth attendants.
The first phase of the project was to establish a day care centre that would include a child development curriculum. Eventually, the centre would be managed by the cooperative itself. The day care centre started with 100 children. Children aged 45 days and older are cared for in the creche while the kindergarten looks after children between 4 and 6 years of age. The centre operates on a flexible schedule, trying as much as possible to coordinate with the working hours of the mothers. Mothers with infants are now able to visit the creche several times a day to breastfeed their children. A typical day at the centre includes various indoor and outdoor activities. Daily lesson plans generally follow the national preschool curriculum, and the centre provides immunization and health care services.

The establishment of the creche and kindergarten at Melka Obra was a great relief to parents and, especially, working mothers. Production in the cooperative system has increased because women are better able to concentrate on their tasks while their children are adequately cared for. Absenteeism from work has fallen dramatically due to the reduced need to take sick children to health clinics. In addition to providing a relatively healthy environment and a balanced diet, the day care experience meets children’s developmental needs as well as stimulating learning in all areas. This foundation provides for a smoother transition to and better performance in school.

In fact, a critical problem faced by the community was the placement of children from the preschool in regular primary schools once they completed kindergarten. With the nearest school some six kilometers away, young children were not able to walk that distance in extremely hot weather. Having received preschool training, parents were anxious that their children continue their education, so they put pressure on the Ministry of Education. As a result of these developments, an elementary school has now been established in Melka Obra. In addition, a functional literacy programme for adults has also been started.

VENEZUELA: AN UNCONVENTIONAL FORM OF CHILD CARE (49).

During the last few years, the difficult social and economic situation in Venezuela has dramatically affected the low-income classes and poor households. In response to a deteriorating situation, in 1989 the Venezuelan government started developing the National Plan to Fight Poverty, which aimed at solving the needs of the poorest sectors. As part of the new social policy of the country, the implementation of a series of programmes orientated towards improving globally the attention and care of children was coordinated, with emphasis on the Plan for Massive Extension of the Day Care Homes Programmes sponsored by the Ministry of the Family.

The day care homes are an unconventional form of child care created in 1973. The approach arises from a solution that working mothers in many urban settings had traditionally resorted to, which consisted of leaving their children in neighbour’s homes while they were working outside the home. From the beginning, the programme was satisfactorily implemented. The programme’s fundamental objective is to provide child care services on a daily basis to low-income homes with children from 0 to 6 years of age. Integral attention is provided for the children in the areas of education, health, nutrition, affection and recreation while their parents are at work.
The programme operates in conventional houses equipped to provide adequate attention to groups of up to eight children of preschool age. A caretaker mother is present in the house every day and voluntarily attends a group of children who live in nearby areas. She is responsible for providing children with a clean, secure and pleasant environment. The children arrive at the home early in the morning and, depending on the needs of their families, stay there a few hours or the whole day. The national government is directly responsible for the coordination and financing of the programme through the Ministry of the Family. The Ministry formulates the guidelines of the programme and it supervises the implementation and operation of the homes. Also, the Ministry coordinates the participation of different public and private institutions that provide technical and financial support to the programme. Caregivers are selected by the Ministry, which also makes sure that their houses meet the basic hygienic and safety requirements.

Since 1989, when the programme initiated a plan of expansion, the number of day care homes has increased considerably. Essential support to this expansion process has been given by non-governmental organizations as well as by the active participation of urban communities themselves. By the end of 1990, 10,793 day care homes and 731 multi-day care homes cared for 101,900 children from low-income families.

**PERU:**

**WOMEN, CRISIS AND SURVIVAL STRATEGIES (50)**

Peru, a country of 22 million inhabitants, presents a highly complex social structure. As a result of an escalating migration process over the last 20 years, 70 per cent of the population now lives in urban areas (in 1940, 70 per cent of the population was rural). Lima, the capital city, accounts for one third of the country's population. Half of Lima's population lives in the marginal neighbourhoods of the city in critically poor conditions. The political violence that has afflicted the country since 1980 peaked in the last two years and has affected negatively the country's economic and social situation. Additionally, harsh policies of economic adjustment combined with a process of deep recession have led Peru to spiralling inflation rates, high unemployment and increasing poverty levels.

Under these conditions, women and children are the weakest among the weak. Poverty together with the daily struggle for survival are depriving them of adequate access to economic resources, health services and education. Throughout the last decade, survival strategies for coping with the effects of the crisis have multiplied. Women's initiatives in organizing collectively have proven to be a key strategy in the struggle for survival. Peruvian women offer a unique example of self-empowerment among Latin American women. The self-help grassroots organizations formed by women have become the springboard for their own empowerment both within the family and the larger community. The movement of urban women started in the fifties with the massive migration of young men and women from the rural areas to the cities. Traditionally, women represent the forces of solidarity, cooperation and integration in society as they are responsible for managing at both the family and the community level all issues related to their well-being and preservation. By forming self-help organizations in response to dire circumstances, Peruvian women are able to wield some form of control over their own lives in a context of otherwise uncontrollable factors.
This rich heritage of women's grassroots organizations inspired a UNICEF-supported programme for women's mobilization and child survival that started in 1987. This integrated programme includes interventions that support women's mobilization and participation. The immediate objective of the programme is to establish the essential conditions for progressing towards a full physical and psychological development of the child. In fact, the objective of the programme — expressed in terms of child survival — constitutes the driving force behind the institution and consolidation of structural changes. Moreover, children's well-being and development are understood as symbols of harmonious social progress.

The organization of women to improve children's well-being attempts to attain the following results: (1) the massive dissemination and practice of basic knowledge and skills which have a significant impact upon child survival and development; (2) the active participation of the principal beneficiaries in the management and qualitative monitoring of public services geared to meeting basic demands; (3) the formulation of participatory demands capable of developing into increasingly complex forms of organization; and (4) the expansion at all levels (family, community, regional and national) in women's decision-making capacities. At the same time, the operational scheme is characterized by actions leading to greater self-sufficiency, complementarity with public services, and improvement of groups' abilities to formulate their priorities and demands.

The programme utilizes messages related to three blocks of interrelated and motivating themes: (1) child health and development; (2) women's health; and (3) family income. For each of these blocks, there are specific, effective, low-cost actions to pursue collectively. Since mobilization is conceived of as a collective organizational process, the strengthening of capacities for meeting basic demands does not relate to individual training. Consequently, the programme does not concentrate on generic training activities in health or education. The basic idea, instead, is to demonstrate the usefulness of joint actions using criteria based on solidarity. For this reason, the 'Women's Mobilization Programme' aims to involve 2,000,000 low-income women of child-bearing age within five years. At present, the programme is in the final stage of implementation. During the first years, efforts were concentrated on identifying and improving materials and methodologies. By the end of 1988, the Programme started to consolidate different activities resulting from the original mobilization initiatives, and to expand the programme coverage. The programme currently involves the participation of 170 grassroots and/or intermediary organizations with a total membership of 1,200,000 women, and is implemented in all 24 districts of the country.

Since its inception, this Programme has evolved into a consensual, alternative scheme for the enhancement of child welfare and development. Community solidarity has been translated into concrete actions such as national campaigns for massive vaccination and the prevention of diarrhoea, the establishment of communal units for oral rehydration, day care centres and communal kitchens. However, for many women, involvement in the Programme has provided their first experience of interacting closely with others and making a contribution to the community beyond their immediate family. This new type of interaction has led to changes in women's attitudes as well as those of their spouses and members of the general community towards them. Perhaps most importantly, though, it has enabled women to develop a stronger sense of self-esteem.
MOROCCO: A CRÈCHE FOR WOMEN WORKERS IN CASABLANCA

Casablanca is the largest city in Morocco and the most powerful economic centre in the country. Due to modern communication and transportation systems, Casablanca has developed rapidly and attracted new industries, commercial activities and investment. However, while Casablanca has succeeded in attracting profitable business, it has also attracted large numbers of migrants from the rural areas. Consequently, Casablanca's centre and residential suburbs are now filled by slums and poor neighbourhoods. Initially, this influx of population filled the huge demand for labour that had developed with the rapid growth of the city. Eventually, however, the demand for labour diminished, and unemployment brought increasing poverty and deprivation. While people coming from rural areas may have been equipped to provide for their basic needs, in the big city they found themselves virtually defenceless.

Because of its size and anonymity, Casablanca has also attracted unwed mothers seeking to avoid the censure of cultural and religious traditions. In Morocco, as in the other nations of the Maghreb region, Islam is the religion of the State, and family law is regulated according to its principles. Marriage is the social institution that guarantees the continuity and order of the society. Therefore, according to Moroccan law, unmarried mothers and their children have no legal rights. Children of unwed mothers are not entitled to a father's surname, and if their mother is unknown they may carry no last name at all. Rejected by their own families or by society at large, unmarried women find themselves in very difficult circumstances. In some extreme cases, they resort to prostitution or end up abandoning their children in the hope that their families will take them back.

Unfortunately, existing social services are insufficient. Terre des Hommes, a non-governmental organisation which has operated in Casablanca since 1983, has established some day care centres/crèches for single or divorced mothers and widows with young children. The main objectives of the project are: (1) to prevent child abandonment; (2) to allow children to benefit from appropriate care until teaching school age; and (3) to allow mothers to work and improve their social and economic position. Admission to the centre is open to single mothers who receive no support from their families or who do not have sufficient income or material resources to support their children; mothers who have a permanent home; working mothers who have a regular income-generating activity; and women willing to use appropriate contraceptive methods.

It is obvious that most mothers who go to the centre for the first time do not comply with all the above requirements. The first visit to the centre is meant to help the mothers regain their self-confidence and encourage the belief that, in spite of their difficult position, they can keep their children and care for them. Women are encouraged and supported in their search for a safe place to live in the city and a stable job. Their children, in turn, are admitted to one of the sections of the centre according to their age and level of psychomotor development. The day care centre in Casablanca serves children from birth to 7 years of age. The centre includes a baby ward (0-18 months) for 15 children, an infant ward (18 months to 3 years) for 20 children, and two children's wards (3 to 5 and 6 to 7 years) for 50 children.

Activities at the centre are aimed at enhancing the psychosocial and motor development of children. They are observed closely and games are adapted to their age. For children over 6 years, most activities are especially designed to give them the
necessary tools to start primary school. Three meals are given to children daily. Since the majority of mothers lack sufficient means and time to prepare meals, children's essential nutritional needs are mostly met at the centre.

The centre also offers some services to the 70 mothers whose children attend the crèche. For most of these women, the centre represents a quick stop on their daily way between work and home. However, all too often these women lead isolated lives both at home and at work. As a result, they express an enormous need to confide in someone, to talk about their problems, and to receive some support. Groups have been organized at the centre to provide support and basic training which may help women get better-paid jobs.
VI. POLICY AND PROGRAMME IMPLICATIONS: TOWARDS AN INTEGRATED APPROACH

Overview

Economic recession, structural adjustment, high inflation and rising unemployment will continue to severely undermine the survival and well-being of women, who constitute the majority of the population in many countries. Increasingly, women and adolescent girls, especially in Africa and Latin America, are forced to work long hours for minimum wages in the barely profitable informal sector. Women heading their own households with high child dependency ratios are particularly vulnerable. Many countries in Latin America and the Caribbean have reported increases in malnutrition among children under five. Although women’s nutrition is not well reported, the low birth weights in Africa, Latin America, the Caribbean and South Asia suggest a continuing problem. In areas of the world afflicted by armed conflicts, droughts and other disasters, women are forced to work in increasingly harsh environments to support themselves, their children and their families.

Seminar participants concluded that the benefits of collaboration between those concerned with the healthy growth and development of children and those whose interests lie with the social and economic roles of women have tremendous policy implications for planners in these respective fields (52). For those concerned with women’s issues, collaboration provides a more complete grasp of women’s multiple responsibilities and the multifaceted contribution made to families, communities and societies. It also generates a broad-based, critical perspective to monitor the progress of policy and project interventions targeted to women. By challenging the simplistic notions of women as mothers or as workers, this perspective provides a more accurate basis for understanding women’s as well as families’ coping and survival strategies. In addition, the focus on child care and health provides additional insights into the distribution pattern of resources within households. Finally, and perhaps most importantly, it recognizes that women’s work choices are almost always influenced by their need to care for and nurture their children.

For those who focus their professional energies on enhancing the healthy growth and development of children, collaboration provides additional insights into the lives of mothers of young children. For example, it enlarges the range of available strategies to integrate efforts to enhance women’s own economic, educational and health status and well-being. Second, it requires that a broad set of factors be considered in the design, implementation and evaluation of early child development programmes. Third, better recognition of women’s multiple roles and responsibilities provides a more realistic appreciation of the various constraints women face in adopting new practices and utilizing existing services. Finally, an appreciation of the variability in women’s work patterns makes it clear that child development programmes must be developed with sensitivity and the capacity to adapt to women’s work environments.

Capitalizing on the collective energies and common goals of these two groups, strategic policy and programme implications for women, their work and their need for child care emerged during the Seminar. The recommendations, which are summarized in the following section, include issues related to: increasing awareness and improving policy analysis; strengthening data resources; monitoring social, legal and regulatory dimensions; developing national child care and family policies; and integrating child care components into women-in-development initiatives. Following these general recommendations, opportunities for integrating this perspective into UNICEF’s ongoing strategies are highlighted. These recommendations and opportunities do not represent a complete account of all of the most promising approaches, but rather the ones which proved of particular interest to the participants.

Policy and Programming Recommendations

Increasing awareness and improving policy analysis

Most countries made commitments during the United Nations Decade for Women (1976-1985) to give priority to the formulation of coherent national and sectoral policies for the advancement of women. However, this objective remains to be achieved in many developing countries. An analysis of barriers to the implementation of these policies indicates that the absence or inadequacy of national policies on gender issues and women’s status is due to inefficient political will, cultural barriers, lack of reliable
data and frequent changes in the institutional base for policy formulation. Policy-oriented research on the impact of economic crises and structural adjustment on women needs to receive greater attention. Technical assistance may be needed, including to UNICEF offices, regarding the collection of gender-disaggregated data and the development of socioeconomic indicators on women to improve policy formulation.

Opportunities to support existing arrangements and create new mechanisms for articulating women’s concerns and monitoring their progress should be fostered. Also, support is needed to strengthen capacities for better coordination among governmental agencies to promote policies in favour of women. Special efforts are needed to ensure that the results of research and policy studies reach key decision makers in and outside government. With a strong emphasis on issues relating to employment generation and poverty alleviation, policies should highlight the need for supportive services for child care, family planning, education, training and other basic services with an emphasis on women-headed households. Efforts should also be made to intensify advocacy and other support to empower women’s groups, organizations and networks to be fully involved in the economic, social and political decision-making process. Changes resulting from democratization and political reforms offer dramatic new opportunities for the political empowerment of women and their more effective organization at the local and national levels.

**Strengthening data resources**

The need for gender-disaggregated data is a common theme that cuts across all issues related to women, work and child care. Understanding the division of labour and resources between women and men is central to understanding a country’s economic and social conditions. Lack of sensitivity towards gender differences leads to inadequate planning, implementation and evaluation of programmes. Issues related to the status of women and their full participation in development activities affects the achievement of strategic objectives. Thus, it is important to identify (and, if possible, measure) women’s contribution as participants in, agents for and beneficiaries of programme objectives.

In addition to the need for gender disaggregation of existing data, new indicators and conceptual models are needed in order to grasp the complexities, monitor the trends and anticipate future outcomes resulting from the rapidly changing circumstances of women’s lives. In particular, Seminar participants expressed concern over the limitations of existing data sources regarding women’s labour force participation and patterns of family structure and formation.

The ‘invisibility’ of women workers in labour force statistics is well established. A wide variety of labour relations are compressed into the four-standard classifications: own-account worker, employer, unpaid family worker and wage worker. To understand the mechanisms of labour force participation, data on the factors influencing women’s control over economic decisions are required. For example, it is suggested that data are needed regarding women’s control over the means of production, such as land, raw materials, tools, and space in which to work. Women usually have little or no control over these factors as their labour status is often determined by middlemen who own the equipment and contract the labour. Women are often exploited by merchants or manufacturers who charge them excessive amounts for materials so that their net income is less than it may appear for piece payments. Because of missing or inaccurate data, there are relatively few insights into women’s control over the proceeds of output or the income derived from work. Crude earnings are often misinterpreted as indicators of net disposable income. Women may receive very little net disposable income for themselves or for their children because of deductions made by other family members or intermediaries. Thus, when designing relevant policies and effective international assistance strategies, there is a need to focus on the relative invisibility of working women, but also on mechanisms to overcome the limitations and distortions inherent in conventional data collection and systems of data analysis regarding employment and income (21).

As was apparent during the Seminar, a second area in need of more sophisticated data collection and analysis is the pattern and structure of female headship of households. Given the absence of consistent time-series data on family formation and structure, little is known about the determinants and prevalence of
female headship. It can be assumed, however, that the incidence of female-headed or -maintained families is likely to increase as a result of many factors, including increased adolescent fertility in some parts of the world, increasing rates of marital disruption, changing attitudes and belief systems regarding families, and male and female migration (53).

It is recommended that UNICEF together with its partners establish regional action research networks in an effort to:

1. systematically document regional and socio-economic patterns and trends in households headed or maintained by women and the implications of these trends for dependent children, especially young children;

2. strengthen the capacity of researchers to undertake qualitative and quantitative studies about the determinants and dynamics of female headship, and, more generally, of the role of gender and family variables in the inter-generational transfer of poverty;

3. analyse policy alternatives to assist low-income, female-headed or -maintained households, including lessons learned from industrialized and developing country experiences;

4. analyse the relationships between demographic and socio-economic change, family formation and poverty, and the awareness of policy makers at national and international level of trends and implications of female-headed and -maintained households for socio-economic development.

Monitoring social, legal and regulatory dimensions

As noted in a Progress Report (3) to UNICEF’s Executive Board, women’s low social and legal status is a major obstacle to their advancement in many countries. Low status often begins at birth when sons are preferred to daughters. Undervaluation of women’s work and a perception of daughters as a social and economic liability influence a family’s and society’s differential investments. Custom, religious and civil laws in many countries discriminate against girls and women, even where the national constitutions accord them equal rights. The most serious concerns include issues related to women’s rights in marriage, inheritance, land and property ownership, employment, access to credit and domestic violence.

In this context, especially in low-income countries, national or state laws and regulations have rarely been viewed as relevant or indeed necessary to support practical strategies for improving the economic conditions of women. The experience of the past decade serves to highlight the absence of a supportive legislative structure. Constraints that inhibit the economic and social rights of women have seldom been removed. Legal rights and measures that are supportive of women have not been adequately developed. Change, when initiated, has usually remained as non-binding social policy. In many countries, the existence of personal or customary laws continues to give legal validity to discriminatory practices, and is a barrier to acceptance of a uniform legislative policy.

The failure to mobilize legislative, judicial and regulatory reforms may be viewed as an indication of ineffective political action and lobbying on women’s issues. Without lobbying power, organization and access to legal assistance, it is unlikely that a supportive legal framework will be developed. Thus, the notion of empowerment through legal rights must be seen as a strategy for ensuring that women receive equitable treatment, especially in terms of employment and access to key social services. It is also a method of stimulating women’s participation in development activities.

To increase awareness of rights and legal resources among both women and children, and to move towards more effective use of legislation and improved compliance, the following specific measures are recommended:

1. Better monitoring and enforcement of labor legislation and regulations to protect both working children and working women, especially pregnant women and those with infants and young children; full recognition of the special needs of low-income women who are also heads of households; legislative reform will sometimes be needed;

2. Policy and legislative or regulatory reform to encourage, where appropriate, suitable day-care
facilities at or near women's work places (including in markets and other informal work sites), as well as child care combined with formal or non-formal educational opportunities for women;

3. improved monitoring and enforcement of laws on compulsory and free primary education; strong advocacy for the adoption of such laws, when necessary; efforts to minimize the indirect or hidden costs of basic education, including school materials, uniforms and transportation;

4. legislative, regulatory and other pressures, such as social action litigation, where possible, to eliminate gender stereotyping, especially in school curricula and the mass media (including in commercial advertising), combined with affirmative action to make boys and men more aware of, and prepared for, their own child-rearing responsibilities;

5. policy, legislative and other measures to encourage later marriage and child-bearing, especially where teenage pregnancy is a serious problem, including measures to promote what UNICEF describes in its 1992 State of the World's Children (54) report as the "responsible planning of births"; in some countries, special measures need to be taken to enforce existing laws concerning the minimum age of marriage.

UNICEF and its allies now have a much stronger mandate to cooperate with governments and others in seeking compliance with these sorts of standards as a result of the Convention on the Rights of the Child. An important element of the strategy to improve compliance and enforcement of this instrument is the reporting and monitoring process set up by this Convention. The fact that this process is both mandatory and public (including encouragement of public scrutiny of official reports) provides a key opportunity which UNICEF, other concerned agencies and NGOs should not neglect. For UNICEF, it also represents a challenge to broaden the framework of the situation analysis and monitoring and evaluation processes associated with its regular country programmes. This broader approach should include support enabling governments and NGOs to review pertinent legislation relating to children and women in order to promote compliance with the Convention on the Rights of the Child and with other relevant international laws and covenants.

Finally, as discussed throughout the Seminar, the international labour conventions provide opportunities for better monitoring and enforcement of legal norms and regulations for the protection of women workers, with particular attention to the explicit or implicit deregulation of labour legislation in sectors dominated by women. Of special importance is the utilization of the regulatory controls provided in ILO conventions and recommendations mechanisms to extend the scope and raise the standards of protective measures which favor working mothers with young children. In addition to the actions mentioned above, regulation and enforcement of international norms and national legislation concerned with the following issues are recommended:

1. maternity protection, including measures to ensure maternal leave and benefits, and appropriate support to breastfeeding mothers during the first four to six months following birth;

2. labour policies to provide job security to women workers with child care responsibilities;

3. parental leave which includes, when possible, the concept of fathers taking leave, either to assist with the care of infants after a mother has returned to work or with the needs of sick or disabled children;

4. occupational health and safety laws and regulations, including protection of the reproductive functions of both men and women.

If women's vulnerable labour market status is to change, the roles and responsibilities of men in the care of children must also be recognized. The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (1979), recognizes the "common responsibility of men and women in the upbringing of their child, it being understood that the interest of the children is the primordial consideration in all cases" (Article 5 (6)) (55). If the regulations specified within international conventions are to further equality between women and men, they must be accompanied by major education and social mobilization campaigns to promote the concept that the family is the concern of each individual, man as well as woman. Society must enable all persons to both exercise their responsibilities as parents and to participate as fully as they desire in the labour force.
Existing or proposed measures to adapt working patterns to the needs of workers with family responsibilities must be seriously considered. If, however, only women utilize these benefits, further marginalization is likely to occur and the traditional division of labour between men and women will be reinforced.

The search for improved mechanisms to promote the well-being of women workers and to simultaneously provide quality child care opportunities should be an area of increased cooperation between ILO, UNICEF and other concerned agencies.

Developing national child care and family policies

The Seminar’s focus on issues relating to women’s status, their working conditions and implications for child care left too little time for consideration of some broader issues of family support policies. This area undoubtedly merits more attention in the follow-up stages, including possible seminars to be organized on a regional or country basis. Simply to set the stage for later analyses, it may be useful to note three main ways that family policies can be especially supportive of women and children:

1. by providing parents with increased time to meet their child-rearing and child care responsibilities (especially through job-protected parental leave, but in some countries also by arrangements for part-time or flexible-time employment), measures can also be explored to encourage increased possibilities for child care by grandparents or other adult family members;

2. by providing parents with cash benefits or tax credits to assist them in meeting the costs of child-rearing and child care;

3. by providing services, either directly related to child care needs (such as parental education, day care services or home visiting programmes for families with special difficulties), or more indirectly (such as providing women with educational or training opportunities to increase their income-earning and employment prospects).

For many developing countries, some of these elements of a comprehensive family policy may seem utopian and unaffordable in the foreseeable future. Before jumping to such a conclusion, however, it is worth reflecting on a number of considerations which may make the notion of comprehensive family policies more relevant to developing countries than might be apparent, especially for some of the ‘middle-income’ or newly industrializing countries.

Firstly, it should not be assumed that developing countries need to follow the predominant model adopted in industrialized countries of financing these family-support measures through regular governmental programmes. The developing world is full of examples of successful non-governmental initiatives in areas such as self-help housing, rural credit, non-formal education, marketing cooperatives and micro-enterprise development. There is no reason why these private-sector or cooperative initiatives could not be better utilized to help meet the child care needs of working parents through much the same combination of time allotments, financial benefits and service provision which characterizes large public sector programmes in most industrialized countries. Innovative joint public/private sector arrangements also need to be explored. The primary requirement is a change of mentality to bring about greater recognition of the fact that supporting parenting and child rearing is decidedly good business, whether the ‘business’ is small-scale and informal or part of the larger and more formal sectors of the economy.

Secondly, although public sector budgets and enterprises are often hard-pressed to provide family or employment-related benefits, there is an increasingly dynamic formal or quasi-formal private sector emerging in those developing countries that have been seeking to encourage private enterprise and export-oriented industries. More concerted political and labour organization action, including by women’s movements, can help to prevent these enterprises from unduly profiting from the relatively weak bargaining position of workers in these new industries, many of whom are young women and sometimes children. As differences in standards of labour practices always exist in all sectors, sustained pressure, including through the mass media where possible, but also through the courts, needs to be brought on those whose practices do not meet minimum standards. Tax or other incentives can also help to encourage better and more family-sensitive employment practices.
Thirdly, consideration should be given to the cost of not providing additional support to families, particularly the high-risk and often female-headed households which were of particular concern at this seminar. One of the negative consequences of neglecting the child-rearing support needs of at-risk families is clearly poor school performance and high rates of repetition and drop-out — costs both to families and to society. Other costs result from the various forms of social marginalization affecting children, including alcohol and drug addiction, teenage pregnancy and juvenile delinquency, which are often associated with neglectful or abusive family settings.

Finally, as noted in Section V, more and more developing countries are beginning to support, through a range of strategies, early childhood development programmes. These fall into the service provision category of the three-fold division of family support policies outlined above. Before a country (or province, district or municipality) fully develops the child care service element of a broader strategy, it makes good economic sense to consider how the other elements (parental time and cash benefits) might complement the child care component. Rough estimates generally suggest that 85-95 per cent of the resources for early child development come from households. Building on that existing ‘investment’ (by providing time, financial support or home-based services) may sometimes be more cost-effective than providing out-of-home child care services, even if ‘community-based’. The catch comes if the added burden of doing more for child development in the household, even with cash incentives or job-protected leave, falls disproportionately on the mother, who already carries the major share of the child-rearing and household management responsibilities. Hence, the importance attached throughout this Summary Report to finding ways (which can include job-related incentives) to enhance men’s participation in child-rearing and meeting the family’s child care responsibilities.

Creating linkages: child care and women-in-development initiatives

Whatever possibilities there may be for strengthening the ability of families to provide child care at home, the fact remains that the current level of services is highly inadequate. Moreover, the demand for non-maternal child care will continue to increase while current services may not only fail to expand but actually be reduced in some countries. In spite of this situation, there exists considerable experience regarding a variety of affordable quality programmes, formal and non-formal. What is needed, therefore, is the concerted will of governments, employers and communities to implement and sustain these initiatives. In defining options, however, it is important to recognize that the majority of low-income women are employed outside the formal sector and are therefore little affected by legal statutes. Given the wide variation in women’s work patterns and family structures, a range of complementary alternatives must be rigorously pursued. The strategies reviewed in the case studies illustrate some of the options currently available. In measuring programme coverage, success must be conceived as the sum of diverse, small-scale programmes that can respond to particular needs and circumstances.

Clearly, existing and new programmes need to find better ways to strengthen traditional patterns of care. When available, care by extended family members should be strengthened by providing caregivers with education, training and access to existing supportive services. However, Seminar participants emphasized that traditional strategies involving the removal of older siblings, most notably girls, from school to act as caregivers must be replaced. In addition, efforts to support nannies so that they may stay in close contact with or closely supervise the care of their infants during the first year or two of life, while maintaining their ability to earn income, should receive greater attention. In addition to paid maternity leave (or cooperative maternity insurance) for women in formal sector jobs, improved marketing and incentives for home-based production and child care exchanges should be developed for women in the informal sector.

Governments must play a role in defining and monitoring standards of quality control for both formal and informal child care initiatives. Poor quality programmes with inadequate staff and facilities may have a negative impact on children and generally may not be utilized by women and their families despite their need for services. In addition, quality child care programmes simultaneously address the
care and the development needs of the young child. Programmes must move beyond a custodial view and recognize the need to provide a comprehensive range of health, nutrition and developmentally appropriate learning opportunities for children. Low-cost strategies for providing a mix of approaches are feasible.

Perhaps the most encouraging finding to emerge from the Seminar was the shared recognition of the intersecting needs of women and children. Participants explored opportunities for incorporating a child development component into existing interventions designed to improve the overall status of women. For example, women-in-development initiatives designed to increase earning capacities have included a range of strategies such as the creation and support of enterprises run by and for women; application of 'appropriate technology' to help decrease the time spent in domestic activities; development of credit schemes; implementation of training and education programmes; and provision of organizational assistance to women engaged in market activities. Both the scale and the success of these initiatives could be enhanced by incorporating components to address the child care needs of parents with young children.

A second possible approach involves the development of alternative forms of child care in an 'appropriate technology' framework. Recognizing the need to relieve women from the burden of domestic chores, many appropriate technology projects have been supported. Of particular relevance are those initiatives that reduce the time spent in getting water, fetching firewood and processing food. With the exception of the introduction of bottle-feeding which is rarely beneficial to the young child and often dangerous, little consideration has been given to alternative ‘technologies’ or forms of child care. Such an approach might concentrate on neighbourhood care in homes and the development of indigenous learning materials for both children and parents.

Thirdly, Seminar participants suggested the possibility of developing credit schemes to support alternative child care initiatives. A home day care programme in Colombia exemplified the opportunity for collaboration between credit schemes and the provision of adequate child care. In this programme, women are provided with credit, enabling them to make improvements in their homes, which are then used as home day care locations.

In an effort to increase the quality of care provided through such programmes, a fourth suggestion focussed on skill training programmes. A wide range of training programmes designed to increase the income-earning capacity of women has been implemented. While some effort has been made to upgrade traditional skills, many programmes have failed to reinforce traditional activities and the accompanying low levels of prestige. As a result of this bias, child care training as a potential income-earning activity has been ignored. In addition, when such training does exist, programmes have focussed exclusively on women's needs with little attention given to the needs of men. These minimal short-term training schemes lead to jobs with ‘gratuitous’ well below the minimum salary. Better training gradually leading to improved rates of pay could have tremendous benefits for both women and children.

Finally, recognizing the powerful impact of education on women’s lives, participants emphasized the benefits of women’s literacy and education programmes. For example, higher levels of education are associated with decreased fertility rates, increased birth spacing, and improved health and nutritional care of children. In the long term, improving women’s educational opportunities may provide the most promising of all available strategies. As discussed throughout the Seminar, educational discrimination begins for many girls as early as the preschool period. Thus, efforts to attack disproportionate rates of illiteracy among women must include attention to the preparation of girls for primary school. It has been shown that early care and development programmes provide one opportunity for overcoming gender inequalities that are already in place at the time of school entry. In addition, one of the barriers to young girls’ education relates to the care and nurturing of younger siblings. Innovative strategies, such as locating preschools in close proximity to primary school, should be seriously pursued.

In order to maximize and ensure positive benefits to both women and their children, these recommendations must be seen as complementary and reinforcing strategies. It is in the best interests of all those concerned to continue to seek and identify
ways to overcome the artificial distinction between women’s reproductive and productive capacities and responsibilities. As participants concluded, women’s work and a child’s right to care and nurture are not conflicting but rather complementary. While poverty and work have not prevented women from contributing to child survival and development, clearly the quality of care from a child development perspective will be affected by illiteracy, economic pressure and the stress of combining work with family responsibilities. Lack of skills and bargaining power as an exploited cheap source of labour clearly diminishes women’s capacity to provide the best quality care for their children and encourages the exploitation of young girls within and outside the home.

Implications for UNICEF and Its Allies

Seminar participants were encouraged by the considerable support and affirmation of the issues addressed in this Third Innocenti Global Seminar as a result of two major international events, namely, the World Conference on Education for All (57) and the World Summit for Children (58). In March 1990, the World Conference on Education for All, organized by UNICEF, UNESCO, the World Bank and UNDP, brought together governmental representatives from over 150 countries and representatives from more than 200 non-governmental organizations. The Declaration approved at the Conference included the following statement:

“Learning begins at birth. This calls for early childhood care and initial education. These can be provided through arrangements involving families, communities, or institutional programmes, as appropriate.” (Article 5)

The Framework for Action also set some objectives to be integrated into programmes and initiatives over the present decade, including:

“Expansion of early childhood care and development activities, including family and community interventions, especially for poor, disadvantaged, and disabled children...” (Paragraph 8)

Although child development was not a main issue at the World Summit for Children, held in September 1990, the first Basic Education goal endorsed and formulated at the Summit is the expansion of early childhood development activities including appropriate access to early child development and community-based interventions. Moreover, the Summit Declaration and Plan of Action singled out with urgency the situation of the girl child and called for support for her full and equitable development as an indispensable step towards achieving equality for women:

“Strngthening the role of women in general and ensuring their equal rights will be to the advantage of the world’s children. Girls must be given equal treatment and opportunities from the very beginning.” (Summit Declaration, paragraph 12)

“Women in their various roles play a critical part in the well-being of children. The enhancement of the status of women and their equal access to education, training, credit and other extension services constitute a valuable contribution to a nation’s social and economic development. Efforts for the enhancement of women’s status and their role in development must begin with the girl child. Equal opportunity should be provided for the girl child to benefit from the health, nutrition, education and other basic services to enable her to grow to her full potential.” (Summit Plan of Action, paragraph 15)

UNICEF considers the reduction of gender disparities as a major strategy for the achievement of the goals for children and development in the 1990s. In that context, it is advocating the establishment of specific goals for the girl child to be achieved by the year 2000. In April 1990, the UNICEF Executive Board endorsed the priority focus given to the girl child and recommended that all UNICEF programmes and strategies in the 1990s explicitly address the status of the girl child and her needs, particularly in nutrition, health and education with a view to eliminating gender disparities. UNICEF was also requested, in collaboration with WHO, UNFPA, UNESCO and all other relevant United Nations agencies, to ensure the effective implementation of gender-sensitive monitoring and evaluation mechanisms in order to assess progress made in reducing disparities between girls and boys in health care, nutrition and primary education programmes.
In the wake of these international events, UNICEF and its allies are in the process of reviewing, reflecting and reconsidering strategies regarding the comprehensive needs of the young child and the capacities of women and families to respond to these needs. In light of this openness, the strategies recommended in this Report should provide valuable insights in shaping the future course of action.

The ‘Baby-Friendly Hospital Initiative’ (59) reinforces the need to support efforts to promote breastfeeding. With support from world leaders, health experts and non-governmental organizations (NGOs), UNICEF and the WHO have now launched this ‘baby-friendly’ initiative to convince hospitals, health services and parents to support breastfeeding. The goals of the initiative encourage hospitals to carry out a set of guidelines while providing good-quality care before, during and after delivery. Recognizing the difficulties working women face in continuing breastfeeding during the first six months, it is recommended that the efforts of this initiative be broadened to address all issues related to sustained breastfeeding, including enacting and enforcing legislation to protect the breastfeeding rights of working women. In this area, as in others, improved support from fathers is also important.

Participants concluded that the success of the Seminar will be measured by the degree to which UNICEF country and regional offices integrate the Seminar’s perspectives into existing strategies and plans of action. Suggested activities could include, for example, efforts to include gender-disaggregated data in situation analyses. The development of new indicators capable of generating the depth of analysis and insights required to understand the economic impact of changing family structures and the lack of control over resources was also suggested. Furthermore, improved understanding of existing patterns and practices of child care is needed in order to design affordable and sustainable interventions.

In an effort to facilitate the design of programmes addressing the interrelated issues of women, work and child care, Seminar participants developed a three-dimensional conceptual framework. As illustrated in Annex 5, the first dimension defines three levels of policy analysis and programme development, including macro international and/or national interventions, meso or intermediate interventions at the sectoral and/or subnational level, and micro interventions implemented at the community and/or enterprise level. The second dimension classifies women’s work along a continuum from subsistence agriculture to industrial or service sector activities. The third dimension places families along a continuum from traditional, extended family types at one end to post-nuclear family structures at the other end. The design of practical and effective interventions involves ‘locating’ the intersection between these two sets of variables. For example, child care interventions for women-headed households whose work environment consists of an unregulated out-of-home enterprise would differ from interventions designed for children living in traditional families whose mothers are engaged in subsistence agriculture. While still at an early stage of conceptual development, this type of framework should help programme planners to analyse the impact of several interrelated continuous variables. Planners must keep in mind that the actual situations implied by this framework are complex, varied and constantly changing over time.

The participants also identified the need to incorporate women’s work and child care components into ongoing UNICEF training activities related to women in development, gender analysis, ‘girl child’ initiatives, basic education and child development. Finally, it was recommended that UNICEF country offices engage in serious efforts to monitor selected programmes that address the intersecting needs and rights of women and children.

As reflected in this Summary Report, the insights and perspectives of Seminar participants were many and varied. Different situations in distinct countries and cultures, often reflecting varying degrees of discrimination against women and the girl child, require careful analysis at the national and subnational level. In general, however, participants found more in common than might have been expected in a cross-cultural ‘global’ Seminar of this sort — giving rise to expectations of considerable advantage to be gained, not least in the political sphere, by pursuing this critical topic on an international as well as national and more local basis.


(14) Buvac, Mayra (1990), The Vulnerability of Women-headed Households: Policy Questions and Options for Latin America and the Caribbean, Santiago: Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean.


63


65
ANNEX 1: SEMINAR THEMES

Changing Family Structures: Causes and Consequences
To examine the impact of urbanization, industrialization, real family income and migration on the structure and function of the families in the third world. Analysis will compare and contrast the impact of these factors on families in various regions of the developing world. Emphasis will be placed on examining child-rearing patterns and child care needs and arrangements developed to cope with these changes.

Women and Work: Changing Patterns and Responsibilities
To examine the impact of recent economic and sociological factors on patterns of women's work. Women working away from home in formal and informal settings as well as those who work within the family will be discussed.

The Effects of Women's Work on Women's and Child Health, Nutrition and Development
To review the data on the relationship between working women and their health and nutritional status as well as the impact of maternal work patterns on the health, nutrition and development of their infants and young children. The increased burden placed on women to successfully combine income-generating activities with the need to care for and nurture their children will be examined.

Women's Rights and Child Rights: Examining the Political, Social and Legislative Dimensions
To examine the issues associated with the interrelationships between women's and children's rights. Social policy and legislation facilitating the compatibility between working women and child care will be presented. Particular emphasis will be placed on policies to support family care of the infant and young child.

To review the set of programmes designed to enhance the status and earning capacity of women, including creation and support of enterprises, application of appropriate technology, development of credit schemes, implementation of skills-training and women's education. Strategies to incorporate child care components into these women-centred programmes will be reviewed.

Early Child Development: A Range of Programming Options
To review the availability of child care programmes in the developing world which best meet the needs of working women and their children and to define a typology of early child development programming alternatives. Placing an emphasis on community-based child care options, guidelines for the design, implementation, and evaluation of high-quality programmes will be analysed. Insights drawn from the experiences of industrialized and newly industrialized countries as well as issues confronting child care policies in Eastern Europe will be also reviewed.
Women, Work and Child Care: Early Childhood Case Studies

To discuss the strengths and weaknesses of programmes assisted by UNICEF and other national and international donors which attempt to maximize and ensure positive benefits to both women and their children. Examples of UNICEF-assisted programmes in Peru, Korea, China, Venezuela, Nepal, Ecuador and Ethiopia will be presented.

Morocco Case Study and Field Visit

To expose participants to the issues related to the intersecting needs of working women and children as addressed through programmes supported by UNICEF/Morocco. Participants will have the opportunity to make selected field visits.

UNICEF Policy and Programming Recommendations and Seminar Follow-up Activities

To generate a set of recommendations for increasing UNICEF’s attention and capacity to implement high-quality programmes which simultaneously address the intersecting needs of working women and their children. Participants will generate suggested follow-up activities to be carried out at national and regional levels.
ANNEX 2:
AGENDA OF THE THIRD INNOCENTI GLOBAL SEMINAR

1. Monday, October 21

Morning
Welcome and Overview
Participant Introductions
(Alan Silverman and Nerfissa Zeroumi)
Innocenti Seminars: Goals and Objectives Concerning Women, Work and Child Care:
UNICEF’s Perspective
(James Himes)

Afternoon
Women and Work: Changing Patterns and Responsibilities
(Chloe O’Gara)
What is a Family?: Women’s Roles in Changing Family Structures
(Pat Engle)

2. Tuesday, October 22

Morning
Panel Discussion:
Changes in Women’s Work and Family Structure: A Regional Perspective
Women’s Economic Contribution to the Family
(Pat Engle)

Afternoon
Working Groups:
Factors Affecting Women’s Economic Contribution to the Family
Plenary Discussion
(Pat Engle and Chloe O’Gara)

3. Wednesday, October 23

Morning
Women’s Work: Effects on Health and Nutrition of Women and Children
(Joanne Leslie)
Panel Discussion:
The Effect of Women’s Work on Family Health: A Country-Programme Response

Afternoon
Working Groups: The Impact of Women’s Work on:
Pregnancy
Infant Development
Early Child Development
School-age Children
Plenary Discussion
(Joanne Leslie)
4. Thursday, October 24

**Morning** The Care of Workers’ Children
(Marie-Claire Séguret)

Women’s Work and Child Rights in South Asia: Conflicting Interests for Child Welfare
(Savitri Goonesekere)

**Afternoon** Working Groups:
The Informal Sector: Should it be Regulated?
The Safety Network: Legislative and Administrative Support
Employment Security: Maternal Leave and Benefits

Plenary Discussion
Marie-Claire Séguret and Savitri Goonesekere

5. Friday, October 25

**Morning** Programmes for Women: UNICEF Programming Strategies
(Misra Elias)

**Afternoon**

6. Saturday, October 26

A Programming Framework: Women, Work and Child Care
(James Himes)

7. Monday, October 28

**Morning** Programming for Child Development: A Range of Complementary Strategies
(Cassie Landers)

Child Development Programmes: A View from UNICEF/China
(Cyril Dalais)

**Afternoon** Case Studies:
Peru (Rachel Hertenberg)
Korea (Jung-Ja Kim)

8. Tuesday, October 29

Site Visit
9. Wednesday, October 30

Morning Case Studies (continued):
- Venezuela (Mercedes Pulido)
- Morocco
- Ethiopia, Nepal, and Ecuador

Afternoon Case Studies Summary: What Have We Learnt?
(James Himes and Cassie Landers)

10. Thursday, October 31

Morning UNICEF Policy and Programming Activities
(Cassie Landers)

Afternoon Seminar Follow-up Activities
(Alan Silverman)
Closing Address
Annex 3:
Participants and Invited Speakers

- **Rita Afsar**
  Research Fellow
  Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies
  Dhaka, Bangladesh

- **Ernestina Agyepong**
  Programme Officer
  UNICEF
  P.O. Box 5051
  Accra-North,
  Ghana-West Africa

- **Karim Akaderi**
  Programme Coordinator
  UNICEF
  S Charia Marrakech
  Rabat, Morocco

- **Cherifa Alaoui**
  Programme Officer
  UNICEF
  8, Charia Marrakech
  Rabat, Morocco

- **Bahiya Jawad Al-Jishi**
  Head
  Children’s Department for the
  General Organisation for Youth and Sport
  Bahrain

- **Wei Bowen**
  Deputy Chief
  International Liaison Department
  All-China Women’s Federation
  Beijing, People’s Republic of China

- **Carlos Castillo Cardona**
  Representative for Colombia and Venezuela
  UNICEF
  Aparato Aéreo 7555
  Bogota, Colombia

- **Cyril Dalais**
  Programme Officer, Education Cluster
  UNICEF
  3 UN Plaza
  New York, NY 10017, USA

- **Ukhaya DeSilva**
  Manager, Estate Area Project
  UNICEF
  P.O. Box 143
  Colombo, Sri Lanka

- **Atsok Elias**
  Women’s Programme Adviser
  UNICEF Regional Office
  P.O. Box 44145
  Nairobi, Kenya

- **Pat Engle**
  Department of Psychology and Human Development
  California Polytechnic University
  San Luis Obispo, CA 93407, USA

- **Aida Girma**
  Project Officer
  UNICEF
  P.O. Box 381
  Kigali, Rwanda

- **Saviri Goonesekere**
  Senior Research Fellow
  UNICEF Innocenti Centre
  Piazza SS Annunziata 12
  Florence 50122, Italy

- **François Gruloos-Lackermans**
  Project Officer
  UNICEF
  P.O. Box 1650
  Bujumbura, Burundi
> Nicolas Gyger  
General Representative  
Terre des Hommes  
25 Bis, Bd Abdelatif ben Kaddour Quartier Racine  
Casablanca, Morocco  

> James Himes  
Director  
UNICEF Innocenti Centre  
Piazza SS Annunziata, 12  
Florence 50122, Italy  

> Chariya Khantavit  
Women & Child Labour Division  
Department of Labour  
Asdeang Road  
Bangkok 10300, Thailand  

> Jung-Ja Kim  
Vice-President  
Korean Women's Development Institute  
1568-1, B-11, Sucho dong, Sucho-Ku  
Seoul, Korea  

> Cassie Landers  
Consultative Group on  
Early Childhood Care and Development  
UNICEF House  
3 United Nations Plaza  
New York, NY 10017, USA  

> Joanne Leslie  
Lecturer, Population and Family Health Division  
UCLA School of Public Health  
10833 Le Conte Avenue  
Los Angeles, CA 90024-7220, USA  

> Cui Linlin  
International Liaison Department  
All-China Women's Federation  
Beijing, People's Republic of China  

> Su-Su Lwin  
Programme Officer, Education/ECD  
UNICEF  
P.O. Box 1435  
Yangon, Myanmar  

> Belinda Manahan  
Director  
Bureau of Women's Welfare  
Manila, Philippines  

> Assyeni Muro  
Project Officer, WID  
UNICEF  
P.O. Box 4076  
Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania  

> Chloe O'Gara  
Women in Development  
Bureau for Science and Technology  
US Agency for International Development  
State Department  
Washington, D.C. 20523, USA  

> Margarita Peña  
General Director  
Teachers' Training Division  
Ministry of Education  
Bogota, Colombia  

> Mercedes Pulido  
Legislative Commission  
for Women's Rights - National Congress  
Avenida Universidad, Esq. San Francisco  
Edificio Centro Mercantil  
Piso 1 - Oficina 1-5  
Caracas, Venezuela  

> Marie-Claire Séguert  
Senior Research Programme Officer  
Working Conditions and Environment Department  
International Labour Organisation  
4, route des Morillions  
CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland  

> Geri Sicola  
Project Officer, Social Mobilisation  
UNICEF  
3 UN Plaza  
New York, NY 10017, USA  

> Alan Silverman  
Training Section  
UNICEF  
P.O. Box 1435  
Yangon, Myanmar
➢ Jamal Tarib
Programme Officer
UNICEF
8, Charia Marrakech
Rabat, Morocco

➢ Nurper Ulkuar
Programme Officer, Education
UNICEF
PKC 17 Cankaya
Ankara, Turkey

➢ Yvonne Villanueva
Senior Programme Planning Officer
UNICEF
P.O. Box 1363
Port-au-Prince, Haiti

➢ Brenda Vigo
Programme Officer, Education/ECD/WID UNICEF
P.O. Box 7429-Domestic Airport Box
Office Lock Box, 1300
Pasay City, Philippines

➢ Nerissa Zerdouni
Representative for Morocco
UNICEF
8 Charia Marrakech
Rabat, Morocco
ANNEX 4: BACKGROUND READING MATERIALS


1. Changing Family Structures: Causes and Consequences


2. Women and Work: Changing Patterns and Responsibilities


3. The Effects of Women's Work on Women's and Child Health, Nutrition and Development


6. Early Child Development: A Range of Programming Options


7. Women, Work and Child Care: Early Childhood Case Studies


Khular, Mala (Ed.), Whither Child Care Services? Child Care as an Essential Input in Women's Development, Centre for Women's Development Studies, New Delhi, 1991.


8. Morocco Case Study and Field Visit


9. UNICEF Policy and Programming Recommendations and Seminar Follow-up Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Levels of policy and programme analysis/deployment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Macro (national)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Neo (international)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Micro (classroom)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Macro (multi-local or municipal)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Opre (micro-local)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Opre (micro-local)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Opre (community)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Opre (community)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Opre (community)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Opre (community)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family Structure and Function</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adult, child and micro-lattices</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Programme Framework**

Addressing the Intersecting Needs of Women, Work and Child Care